



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **K-5**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a “Yes” for all Criteria 1-8.

Tier 2 ratings received a “Yes” for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one “No” for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings received a “No” for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

[Grade K \(Tier 1\)](#) [Grade 1 \(Tier 1\)](#) [Grade 2 \(Tier 1\)](#) [Grade 3 \(Tier 1\)](#) [Grade 4 \(Tier 1\)](#) [Grade 5 \(Tier 1\)](#)

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-k-2> and <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-3-8>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **K**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-k-2>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**⁴ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II⁵ and all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-4 to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet **Non-Negotiable** Criteria 1-3 for the review to continue to Section III.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section III: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

⁴ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “Required” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

⁵ For grades K-5: Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2-3. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| <p>SECTION I. K-12 NON-NEGOTIABLE CRITERIA OF SUPERIOR QUALITY</p> <p>Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II and all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet all of the Non-Negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section III.</p> | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable</p> <p>1. QUALITY OF TEXTS:</p> <p>Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>1a) Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A text analysis that includes complexity information is provided. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis, as well as reader and task considerations. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. • In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. The materials provide extensive read-aloud texts that allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. Each module includes a text complexity analysis in the Teacher Guide Appendix A. The standards alignment is listed along with the qualitative and quantitative measures. Anchor Texts within the four modules offer a range of nineteen informational texts and nine literary texts. The texts’ Lexile levels range from 300L to 1180L. For example, in Module 2, students engage with the core text <i>Farm Animals</i> (370L) by Wade Cooper. Students initially listen to the story during Lesson 2. Then, in Lesson 3, students reread parts of the story and use Think-Pair-Share to identify the main details of the page and identify the role of the animal. This low-complexity informational text allows students to access facts and background knowledge of farm animals. Other books included in this unit are <i>Three Little Pigs</i> (526L), Adaptation, by Raina Moore; <i>The Little Red Hen</i> by Jerry Pinkney (620L); <i>The Three Billy Goats Gruff</i> (500L) by Paul Galdone; and <i>The Year at</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>Maple Hill Farm</i> (560L), by Alice and Martin Provensen. In Module 3, <i>America, Then and Now</i>, students listen to and engage with the text, <i>When I was Young in the Mountains</i> (AD 980L), written by Cynthia Rylant. This text is an informational narrative that provides students the opportunity to reference their own childhood and the way lives change over time. Students also engage with the text, <i>The Little House</i> (890L), by Virginia Lee Burton. This text is the only literary text within the module. Because the text is outside of the Lexile level for the grade, certain sections of the book include figurative language and word choice that will need to be explained. Additionally, in Module 3, students engage with the following texts that do not have an applicable Lexile level: <i>Communication, Then and Now; Schools, Then and Now; Homes, Then and Now</i>. In Module 4, students use a collection of informational texts by Rebecca Hirsch, <i>Africa, Antarctica, Asia, Australia, Europe, and South America</i>, to gather information about each continent’s geographical features, populations, native animals, and modern marvels. These texts range from 410-500L, and are accessible to students with their predictable structure. The remaining informational texts, <i>Introducing North America</i> (730L) by Chris Oxlade and <i>World Atlas</i> (1180L) by Nick Crane provide students with information about features of various geographic regions. Students may need support when</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | engaging with these texts due to the vocabulary and concepts within. The remaining core texts in Module 4 include <i>Moon Rope</i> (430L) by Lois Ehlert; <i>The Story of Ferdinand</i> (710L) by Munro Leaf; and <i>Why Mosquitoes Buzz in People's Ears</i> (770L) by Verna Aardema. |
| | <p>Required Indicator 1b) At least 90% of provided texts, including read-alouds in K-2, are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p> | Yes | <p>At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. The materials include high-quality texts in each module as they introduce children to the joy and rigor of text-based, content-rich learning. Students become aware of how writers and artists leverage these tools to communicate experience. They understand how they can use their senses to process information and learn. Additionally, students gain transferable knowledge of how a text's words and illustrations work together to provide a rich sensory experience. For example, Module 1 begins with Margaret Miller's, <i>My Five Senses</i>, which uses engaging, relatable photographs of children to introduce the five senses and their connection to emotion. To support the work of the first text, students consider Pablo Picasso's blue-period painting <i>Le Gourmet</i>, exploring the senses they use to appreciate and understand a painting. They also examine the senses the subject of the</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>painting uses. Next, students approach the patterned language in Ailiki’s accessible <i>My Five Senses</i>, with a focus on the relationship between words and illustrations. Module 2 includes the two-time Caldecott Honor-winner, <i>The Three Billy Goats Gruff</i>, written by Paul Galdone. Module 3 includes the 1942 children’s picture book, <i>The Little House</i>, written and illustrated by Virginia Lee Burton, and <i>The Little House</i>, which earned the Caldecott Medal for illustrations in 1943. In Module 4, students study the seven continents. They begin by considering the texts <i>Europe</i> and <i>Asia</i>, and the interesting things people can do in these places. In the next set of lessons, students consider another aspect of the world, the various geographical features around which cultures develop. Students learn about these natural features by focusing on two contrasting continents, Africa and Antarctica, and their corresponding texts. The folktale <i>Why Mosquitoes Buzz in People’s Ears</i> prompts students to explore how specifics of language and illustration can transport them to the sights and sounds of African animals. Students continue to learn about animals in <i>Australia</i> and <i>South America</i>, and about aspects of South American customs and culture through another fictional folktale, <i>Moon Rope</i>, featuring Peruvian textiles as well as storytelling. In the last set of lessons, students build a foundation for synthesizing information into an opinion through the study of <i>Introducing North America</i>.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>Throughout the module, the text, <i>World Atlas</i>, provides supplemental information on the continents and reinforces how readers collect various sorts of information from maps. Art studies, such as <i>Earth from Space</i> and <i>Carta Marina</i>, are layered within the lessons and provide insight into visual perspectives on the continents.</p> |
| | <p>Required 1c) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex texts. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Each module includes read-aloud texts to ensure that all students build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text while developing essential skills. For example, in Module 1, The Five Senses, students engage with a variety of texts to answer the question, “What are our senses, and how do they help us learn - as humans and as readers?” The module begins with <i>My Five Senses</i> by Margaret Miller. In Lesson 1, Deep Dive students ask and answer questions about key vocabulary words in <i>My Five Senses</i>. The Deep Dive begins as the teacher displays a copy of the book, <i>My Five Senses</i>, and rereads pages 1-4 stopping on page 4. The teacher asks students, “What does shadow mean?” The teacher models a Thinks Aloud, using the text to define shadow. Next, the teacher rereads pages 5-6 stopping on page 6. The teacher asks, “What does city mean?” The students use Think-</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>Pair-Share to Think Aloud and develop their meaning for the term city. Connecting to this initial text and supporting students' advancement towards the module's questions about the five senses, students also engage with texts such as Pablo Picasso's painting, <i>Le Gourmet</i>, <i>Last Stop on Market Street</i>, <i>Chicka Chicka Boom Boom</i>, and Diego Rivera's painting, <i>Flower Day</i>. In Module 3, America, Then and Now, Lesson 4, the teacher posts and reads aloud the Focusing Question, "How was Cynthia Rylant's life different from your life?" Students Echo Read the question. The teacher explains that in order to understand more about Cynthia Rylant's life, students need to understand the words they are reading. The teacher prompts students to turn to pages 5–6 of <i>When I Was Young in the Mountains</i> by Cynthia Rylant and asks, "What did we learn about a johnny-house that we did not know before? How did the words and pictures help you learn more about a johnny-house? What did this teach us about Cynthia Rylant's life in the mountains in the past?" Students discuss with a partner and then respond. The teacher then asks, "Do we have johnny-houses now?" and adds johnny-house to the Word Wall as a module word. The teacher uses student responses to reinforce that, over time, things can change and that some things from the past look very different today because people change the way they do things over time. The teacher explains</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>that students will look closely at a few pages in the text and use the words and illustrations to define and understand key vocabulary words to help them better understand life in the mountains and how it is different from their own. Key Vocabulary words include swimming hole and pumping. To further understand the changes in America, students engage with a series of informative texts such as <i>Home Then and Now</i>, <i>School Then and Now</i>, and <i>Now & Ben: The Modern Inventions of Benjamin Franklin</i>. In Module 4, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “What makes the world fascinating?” Throughout the module, students interact with a variety of informational and literary picture books to answer the five Focusing Questions, such as <i>Africa</i>, <i>Antarctica</i>, <i>Asia</i>, <i>Australia</i>, <i>Europe</i>, and <i>South America</i>, all by Rebecca Hirsch. For example, in Focusing Question Arc 2, Lessons 9-15, students work towards answering the Focusing Question, “What interesting natural features can people see in Africa and Antarctica?” by engaging with the following texts: “Antarctica Sights and Sounds;” “Where in the World is Carmen Sandiego?”; <i>Africa</i>; and <i>Antarctica</i>. From there, students complete Focusing Question Task 2, an opinion paragraph about whether Africa or Antarctica has the most interesting natural features. This task prepares students for the culminating End of Module task where they create a travel brochure about</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | <p>Required 1d) Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>which of the seven continents they have learned should someone visit.</p> <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. The texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building. For example, in Module 2, Once Upon a Farm, Lesson 21, students analyze repeated language in the text, <i>The Little Red Hen</i>. The lesson begins with the teacher reading aloud pages with phrases that are repeated throughout the text, such as, “Who will help me ___? Asked the little red hen.” “Not I, said the ___.”; and ““Very well then,’ said the little red hen, ‘I will do it myself’.” The teacher then rereads the story once again while the students Choral Read and point out the repeated phrases. At the end of the read-aloud, students Think-Pair-Share the question, “What did you notice about the repeated sentences?” Students reread the text once again during the Deep Dive and take a closer look at the repeated language that characterizes <i>The Little Red Hen</i>. They identify the repeated lines and then consider the connection between the repetition and the story’s problem. Students then engage in a Think-Pair-Share to answer the question, “What words does the author repeat in <i>The Little Red Hen</i>?” The teacher calls on several students to share the repeated words they remember and to</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>share their responses with the whole class. The teacher reinforces that the repeated language in the story helps the reader better understand the story’s problem and resolution. In Module 4, The Continents, Lessons 9, 10, and 12, students engage in repeated readings with the text, <i>Antarctica</i>, written by Rebecca Hirsch. In Lesson 9, the teacher displays the front of the book and students discuss what is familiar about the text and when they have seen a book like this. During the Learn portion of the lesson, students listen to parts of the text and share their observations about Antarctica by using Think-Pair-Share. In Lesson 10, students observe page 9 of the text and identify the heading. Next, students discuss how the heading helps them know what the section is about. Finally, students identify key details throughout the story. In Lesson 12, students answer the Focusing Question, “What interesting natural features can people see in Antarctica?”</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 2. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> | <p>Required 2a) A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text-dependent and text-specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Each module has an Essential Question, which is addressed throughout the module and measured through module learning goals around knowledge, reading, speaking, listening, and writing. Additionally, within each module, lessons are structured into lesson sets with a Focusing Question that connects to the Essential Question of the</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | | | <p>lesson. Each lesson includes a Content Framing Question to further support students in developing knowledge and skills to respond to the module’s Essential Question. Further, questions within the lessons connect to the Essential Questions and are either text specific, requiring students to solely use the text to answer, or text-dependent, requiring students to cite evidence to support the idea. For example, in Module 2, Once Upon a Farm, the Essential Question is “What makes a good story?” In Lessons 1-6, the Focusing Question is “What is true about real Farm Animals?” Then in Lessons 7-12, the Focusing Question is “How do authors create settings?” In Lesson 7, students work to answer the Content Framing Question, “What do you notice and wonder about <i>The Year at Maple Hill Farm</i>?” Students begin by listening actively to a read-aloud of Alice and Martin Provensen’s text, <i>The Year at Maple Hill Farm</i>. The teacher reads aloud specific sections of the text, including pages 1, 14-15, and 22-23, and then students the following questions: “Did the farm and the animals change through the year or did they stay the same?” and “How did the farm animals change throughout the year?” From there, students continue working with a partner to share any observations and questions they have about the text. At the end of the lesson, students Think-Pair-Share the Content Framing Question. In Module 3, America Then and Now, the Essential</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>Question is “How has life in America changed over time?” In Lessons 18-21, students work towards answering the Focusing Question, “How have transportation and communication changed in America?” In Lesson 19, the Content Framing Question is “What is happening in <i>Transportation Then and Now</i> and in <i>Communication Then and Now</i>? During the lesson, students use the text to answer questions, such as “What is the main topic of <i>Transportation Then and Now</i>? What in the text makes you think that?” During the lesson’s Deep Dive, the teacher displays the covers of <i>Transportation Then and Now</i> and <i>Communication Then and Now</i> and explains that the students are going to sort items from the text to develop a better understanding of the terms transportation and communication. The teacher organizes the class into pairs and distributes an equal number of each text to the groups. Half the groups will have <i>Transportation Then and Now</i> and the other half will have <i>Communication Then and Now</i>. The teacher instructs pairs to explore the illustrations in their text to find examples of transportation or communication. The teacher asks, “What is a type of transportation?” and “What is a type of communication?” Students then complete Handout 19A by placing pictures into the correct column, either transportation or communication.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--|
| | <p>Required 2b) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. (Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. Questions and tasks use the language of standards while assessments or culminating tasks bridge multiple texts and advance student learning over the course of the units and term of study. Additionally, modules and lessons include learning goals that reflect the language of the standards. For example, in Module 1, Lesson 6, students ask and answer questions about key vocabulary in <i>My Five Senses</i> (L.K.1.d, L.K.6). The teacher displays the Wonder Wheel and reminds students that wondering is another way to learn more about a text. The teacher posts a blank Wonder Chart labeled “Wonders for <i>My Five Senses</i> by Alikei.” The teacher assigns each group of students a question word, and students use Question Corners to generate their own questions. The teacher gives groups two or three copies of the text to reference. Groups generate one question about the text using their assigned question word. The teacher circulates as groups discuss, and chooses four to six questions to record. In Module 2, Lesson 23, students engage in a Socratic Seminar comparing the Little Red Hen from <i>The Little Red Hen</i> and the third pig from <i>Three Little Pigs</i> (RL.K.1, RL.K.9, SL.K.1, SL.K.6). The teacher displays the Socratic Seminar opening question on</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>the board, “What is different about how the Little Red Hen and the third little pig solve their problems?” Students use the Story Maps and texts for reference. During the seminar, small groups of students use the opening question to begin and continue a collaborative conversation about the texts with peers through multiple peer-to-peer exchanges, using the structure of the talking chips and response cards to follow agreed-upon rules. Students then discuss “How is the way the hen solved her problem the same as the way the third pig solved his problem?” Small groups discuss the question using talking chips and response cards to demonstrate active listening. The teacher rereads the speaking goal from the Speaking and Listening Anchor Chart. Students use Nonverbal Signals, thumbs-up, thumbs-sideways, and thumbs-down, to signal their self-assessment of how well they used active listening.</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 3. COHERENCE OF TASKS: Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include</p> | <p>Required 3a) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. The materials build knowledge and skills in a thoughtful sequence across a series of questions aligned with a task or assessment to support students in making meaning of complex text. Each module includes multiple texts that are connected by theme or topic and focuses on an Essential Question for the</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| <p>components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | | | <p>Module, Focusing Questions for a series of lessons, and a Content Framing Question for each lesson. The Essential Question is posted for reference throughout the entire module as students incrementally build knowledge to answer the question by the end of the module. Each module contains a module map with sequenced activities and tasks in preparation for the End-of-Module Task. For example, in Module 1, the Essential Question is “How do our senses help us learn?” The Focusing Question for Lessons 23-28 is “How do our senses help us learn from Rap a Tap Tap?” In Lesson 24, during the Learn section of the lesson, students experiment with labeling letters. In pairs, students participate in a Think-Pair-Share to the question, “How do you label with letters? What can help you identify the letters?” The teacher turns to pages 17-18 and chooses one detail from the illustration on page 17 to practice making a label. Pairs discuss what is happening in the illustration on page 18 as well as what labels can be added to help readers better understand the illustration. Students then complete Handout 24A, writing at least two labels for the sketch. This activity prepares them for the Focusing Question Task where they write a book about how they used sight and hearing to learn from <i>Rap a Tap Tap</i> and label their drawings. In Module 2, students engage with multiple texts to build their knowledge about farm animals while learning about story elements and what is</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>needed to create a good story. The Essential Question for the module is, “What makes a good story?” Students read the different genres to better understand how different authors use different elements to create their stories. Students have multiple opportunities to listen to stories and discuss the story elements used with the teacher and their peers. The Focus Questions for the module include the following: “What is true about real farm animals?” for Lessons 1-6; “How do authors create settings?” for Lessons 7-12; “How do authors create characters?” for Lessons 13-17; “How do authors create problems and resolutions?” for Lessons 18-23; and “What makes a good story?” for Lessons 29-32. In Lessons 29-32, students use the texts from the module to look at story elements and prepare to draft their End of Module Task, an original narrative set on Maple Hill Farm highlighting one animal learned from the module.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3b) Questions and tasks are designed so that students build, apply, and integrate knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. In each module, reading, writing, and discussion pertaining to complex texts are provided and assist in students understanding and expressing their understanding of the text. For example, in Module 1, Lesson 15, the teacher reads <i>Last Stop on Market Street</i>. After the teacher reads, students use Think-Pair-Share to answer the question, “What do you think</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>the essential meaning of the story might be?” The teacher rereads page 21, and students use Think-Pair-Share again to answer the following questions: “What words does the author use to describe this part of CJ’s city?” and “How does CJ feel about the area? How do you know?” The teacher continues to reread pages and the students continue to use Think-Pair-Share to answer questions. Next, students create a Graffiti Wall by drawing illustrations of the story to demonstrate understanding. In Module 2, Lesson 19, the students look at the words the author uses to describe the characters to understand the characters’ actions. The teacher creates the Story Map for <i>The Little Red Hen</i>. The teacher points to the Characters icon on the map and asks, “What symbol is this? What story elements do we add to this box?” As students respond, the teacher attaches the image of that character to the class Story Map for <i>The Little Red Hen</i> and repeats this until all characters are cataloged on the map. The teacher points to the Setting symbol on the map and asks, “What symbol is this? What story elements do we add to this box?” The teacher attaches the image of the setting to the class Story Map. Students Choral Read the story elements recorded on the Story Map for <i>The Little Red Hen</i>. The teacher instructs students to Think-Pair-Share, and asks, “What have we learned about how authors write about their characters? How do they tell us more about each character?”</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | The teacher reinforces that authors use descriptive words and the characters' actions to create their stories and convey them to readers. |
| | <p>Required</p> <p>3c) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically related words, word families, etc.) rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | Yes | <p>Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. For example, in Module 1, Lesson 23, Deep Dive, Ask and Answer Questions about Key Vocabulary, students ask and answer questions about the vocabulary words in the read-aloud, <i>Rap a Tap Tap</i>. Students work with a partner to reread the story or listen to the story read aloud. The first word students learn about is greet. Students use Think-Pair-Share and consider, "What is happening in the illustration? What clues does that give about the meaning of greet?" Students share what they think the word means. Then the teacher asks students, "Does this definition fit what's happening in the illustration?" Students clap twice if they agree and put their hands on their heads if they disagree or are unsure. This process is repeated for the words, art and folks. In Module 4, Lesson 11, the teacher reminds students that natural features are an important part of a</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>place and that they are created over time by changes in Earth. The teacher divides the class into pairs and distributes a copy of the text to use as they respond to Text-Dependent Questions about the words and pictures. The teacher reads page 15 and asks, “How does the picture on page 14 help us understand what dry means?” and “What else do we learn about the desert from this picture that the words do not tell us?” The teacher reads page 17, then the caption underneath the photo on page 16, and asks, “How does this picture help us understand what few means?” The teacher reads page 19, asks, “What two words do you hear in the word rainforest?” and then asks: “Thinking about those two words, what do you think a rainforest is? What characteristics might a rainforest have?”</p> |
| Section II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Indicators (Grades K-5 only) | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable⁶ 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective,</p> | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4a) Materials provide and follow a logical sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards (based on the Vertical Progression of Foundational Skills) while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only Indicator 4b) Materials provide grade-appropriate instruction and practice for the concepts of print (e.g., following words left to right,</p> | N/A | |

⁶ As applicable.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>top to bottom, page by page; words are followed by spaces; and features of a sentence).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only 4c) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonological awareness instruction (e.g., recognizing rhyming words; clapping syllables; blending onset-rime; and blending, segmenting, deleting, and substituting phonemes).</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4d) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonics instruction. Instruction progresses from simple to more complex sound–spelling patterns and word analysis skills that includes repeated modeling and opportunities for students to hear, say, write, and read sound and spelling patterns (e.g. sounds, words, sentences, reading within text).</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only Indicator 4e) Materials provide multiple opportunities and practice for students to master grade appropriate high-frequency words using multisensory techniques.</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4f) Resources and/or texts provide ample practice of foundational reading skills using texts (e.g. decodable readers) and allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of reading foundational skills, including phonics patterns and word analysis skills in decoding words.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback.</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4g) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and/or informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4h) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. (<i>Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.</i>) • In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns. | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4i) Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring includes attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4j) Foundational Skills materials are abundant and easily implemented so that teachers can spend time, attention and practice with students who need foundational skills supports. | N/A | |
| Section III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality | | | |
| 5. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | Required 5a) Materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The majority of informational texts have an informational text structure. • In grades 3-12, narrative structure (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays) of informational text are also included. | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | Required 5b) Materials include print and/or non-print texts in a variety of formats (e.g. a range of film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories, poetry, and novels). | | |
| | 5c) Additional materials provide direction and practice for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and develop knowledge of classroom concepts or topics. | | |
| 6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE: | Required 6a) Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.⁷</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 6b) The majority of oral and written tasks require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 6c) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s). • In grades 3-12, tasks may include blended modes (e.g., analytical writing). | | |
| | <p>Required 6d) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own | | |

⁷ Technology and digital media may be used, when appropriate, to support the standards addressed in this indicator.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | sentence construction as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage. | | |
| <p>7. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 7a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7b) Materials assess student understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the unit texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students demonstrate the knowledge and skill built over the course of the unit.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7d) Measurement of progress via assessments include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p> | | |
| <p>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 8a) As needed, pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself (i.e. providing background knowledge, supporting vocabulary acquisition). Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of skills or strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>on building knowledge and insight. Texts do not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8c) Materials include guidance and support that regularly directs teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading and discussion about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8d) Materials provide additional supports for expressing understanding through formal discussion and writing development (i.e. sentence frames, paragraph frames, modeled writing, student exemplars).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8e) Materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. Teacher editions are concise and easy to manage with clear connections between teacher resources. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8f) Support for English Learners and diverse learners is provided. Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level. The language in which questions and problems are posed is not an obstacle to understanding the content, and if it is, additional supports are included (e.g., alternative teacher approaches, pacing and instructional delivery options, strategies or suggestions for supporting access to text and/or content, suggestions for modifications, suggestions for vocabulary acquisition, etc.).</p> | | |
| | <p>8g) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. Materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria. | | | |
| Compile the results for Sections I-III to make a final decision for the material under review. | | | |
| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
| I. K-12 Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality⁸ | 1. Quality of Texts | Yes | Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level, according to the requirements outlined in the standards. At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, |

⁸ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | and language. Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building. |
| | 2. Text-Dependent Questions | Yes | A majority of questions in the materials are text-dependent and text-specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. |
| | 3. Coherence of Tasks | Yes | Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|---------------------------|--|
| | | | engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. |
| II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Criteria (grades K-5 only)⁹ | 4. Foundational Skills ¹⁰ | N/A | |
| III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality¹¹ | 5. Range and Volume of Texts | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 7. Assessments | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 8. Scaffolding and Support | | See EdReports for more information. |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier 1, Exemplifies quality | | | |

⁹ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

¹⁰ As applicable.

¹¹ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier 1 rating.



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **1**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-k-2>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**⁴ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II⁵ and all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-4 to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet **Non-Negotiable** Criteria 1-3 for the review to continue to Section III.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section III: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

⁴ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “**Required**” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

⁵ For grades K-5: Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2-3. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| <p>SECTION I. K-12 NON-NEGOTIABLE CRITERIA OF SUPERIOR QUALITY</p> <p>Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II and all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet all of the Non-Negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section III.</p> | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable</p> <p>1. QUALITY OF TEXTS:</p> <p>Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>1a) Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A text analysis that includes complexity information is provided. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis, as well as reader and task considerations. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. • In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. The materials provide extensive read-aloud texts that allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. Each module includes a text complexity analysis in the Teacher Guide Appendix A. The standards alignment is listed along with the qualitative and quantitative measures. Anchor texts within the four modules offer a range of nine informational texts and fifteen literary texts. The texts’ Lexile levels range from 30L to 930L. In Module 1, A World of Books, the core texts include <i>Tomás and the Library Lady</i> (440L) by Pat Mora and Raul Colón; <i>Waiting for the Biblioburro</i> (880L) by Monica Brown and John Parra; <i>That Book Woman</i> (920L) by Heather Henson and David Small; and <i>Green Eggs and Ham</i> (30L) by Dr. Seuss. Picture Books and Informational texts include the following: <i>Museum ABC</i>; <i>The Metropolitan Museum of Art</i>; and <i>My Librarian Is a Camel</i> (700L) by Margriet Ruurs. Module 1, A World of Books, begins with an exploration of museum masterpieces through the lens of the alphabet in <i>Museum ABC</i>. These curated</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>works of fine art offer students a rich opportunity to engage with an accessible text with increasing depth while mining the works of art for details and understanding. The three narrative picture books, <i>Tomás and the Library Lady</i>, <i>Waiting for the Biblioburro</i>, and <i>That Book Woman</i> show, in detail, how books transform each character’s life. In <i>My Librarian Is a Camel</i>, students discover different ways that people can access books around the world and learn about the heroic efforts of those who dedicate their lives to bringing the joy of reading to all. With the final book, <i>Green Eggs and Ham</i>, students experience the power of books for themselves as they delight in how this timeless classic with an inspiring message can impact their lives. Module 2, Creature Features, the module opens with three animal fables, two classic <i>Aesop’s Fables</i>, “The Hare & the Tortoise,” and “The Ants & the Grasshopper,” as well as <i>Seven Blind Mice</i> (350L). These texts show students the lessons they can learn from stories about animals. Next, through a narrative informational biography, <i>Me...Jane</i> (740L) by Patrick McDonnell, students meet 10-year-old Jane Goodall. The text provides a framework for asking and answering questions about the text and illustrations to uncover how and why naturalists observe the features of animals’ bodies and behaviors. Students continue their exploration of animals through <i>Sea Horse: The Shyest Fish in the Sea</i> (930L) by Chris</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Butterworth, whose detailed and layered illustrations and language reveal more with each read. In the final close reads of the module, students engage with skillfully crafted and interactive informational texts, <i>What Do You Do With a Tail Like This?</i> (620L) by Steve Jenkins and Robin Page and <i>Never Smile at a Monkey</i> (920L), to learn facts about animal features and how they can use that knowledge to understand how animals survive and keep people safe.</p> |
| | <p>Required Indicator 1b) At least 90% of provided texts, including read-alouds in K-2, are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. The majority of the texts within each module are crafted for authentic, non-instructional purposes. The texts that are not authentic are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students. For example, Module 3 begins with <i>Feel the Wind</i>, an information-rich introduction to the wind, how it is created, and its effects on people’s lives. In conjunction with this text, students complete a mini-research project to investigate what hurricane winds can do. Then students encounter a different kind of power, and emotions, in the inventive text, <i>Feelings</i>. They use their new knowledge to understand the emotional highs and lows of characters in three stories of the wind, including the following: <i>Gilberto and the</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>Wind</i>; “The Guest,” a short story from <i>Owl at Home</i>; and <i>Brave Irene</i>. Finally, students read <i>The Boy Who Harnessed the Wind</i>, about a real-life young inventor who builds windmills to combat drought in Malawi. Through this text, students learn how William harnesses wind power. Students explore wind power further as they study three windmill paintings by Piet Mondrian throughout the module. Module 4 begins with a brief exploration of <i>Glass Slipper, Gold Sandal: A Worldwide Cinderella</i>. This text serves as an introduction to a diverse compilation of Cinderella stories from around the world. Students’ first Cinderella story is an adaptation of Perrault’s well-known French version. This text, featuring Cinderella and hallmarks such as the glass slipper and fairy godmother, builds students’ foundational understanding of the elements of Cinderella stories. The teacher encourages students to question these ideas as they explore the story around the world to the Caribbean, America, Mexico, and Korea, reading <i>Cendrillon: A Caribbean Cinderella</i>, <i>The Rough-Face Girl</i>, <i>Bigfoot Cinderrrrrella</i>, <i>Adelita</i>, and <i>The Korean Cinderella</i>. The exploration of new texts creates authentic opportunities to compare and contrast stories and characters. With the final two texts of the module, “900 Cinderellas” and a return to <i>Glass Slipper, Gold Sandal</i>, students take a closer look at the role culture plays in Cinderella stories.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | <p>Required</p> <p>1c) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex texts. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Each module includes read-aloud texts to ensure that all students build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text while developing essential skills. For example, in Module 1, <i>A World of Books</i>, students engage with connected texts to build knowledge and collect evidence to answer the Essential Question, “How do books change lives around the world?” Such texts include <i>Museum ABC</i>, which includes curated works of fine art; three narrative picture books, <i>Tomas and the Library Lady</i>, <i>Waiting for the Biblioburro</i>, and <i>That Book Woman</i>, all of which describe how books can transform the characters’ lives; and <i>My Librarian is a Camel</i>, which helps students discover how to access books. In Lesson 21, engage with the text, <i>That Book Woman</i>, and the video “Pack Horse Librarian,” as they work to answer the Focusing Question, “How does the packhorse librarian change life for Cal?” During the lesson, students watch the information video to develop a deeper understanding of packhorses that deliver books to remote villages and compare this information to the <i>That Book Woman</i>. During the Vocabulary Deep Dive at the end of the lesson, students use the text to define multiple meanings for the words</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>signs and duck using sentences from the text such as “Pap says it’s written in the signs how long or short the winter stays.” and “I duck my head and wait until the very last to speak my mind.” In Module 2, Creature Features, students engage with a variety of connected texts to answer the Essential Question, “What can we discover about animals’ unique features?” Students connect ideas and build knowledge about animal features throughout the module and its five Focusing Questions to ultimately write an informative paragraph explaining how animals from the texts use the same feature differently. In Lessons 1-9, students engage with three animal fables, including Aesop’s “The Tortoise and the Hare” and “The Ants and the Grasshopper,” and <i>Seven Blind Mice</i>, to develop knowledge of animal features, as well as an understanding of the lessons they can learn from the stories. During Lessons 10-14, students engage with the text, <i>Me... Jane</i>, and ask and answer questions about the text and illustrations to understand how and why naturalists observe the features and behaviors of animals. In Lessons 21-26, students work to answer the Focusing Question, “How do animals use the same feature in unique ways?” by engaging with the text, <i>What Do You Do With a Tail Like This?</i> Students develop knowledge about animal features and how animals use those features to survive. In Lessons 27-32, students engage with the text, <i>Never Smile at a Monkey</i>, to</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | answer the Focusing Question, “How do animals use their unique features in unexpected ways?” Students develop an understanding of some animal features that can be dangerous to “unsuspecting people,” while also determining the meaning of unsuspecting through the Outside-In strategy. |
| | <p>Required 1d) Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> | Yes | <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. The texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building. For example, in Module 3, Powerful Forces, Lesson 14, students identify the story elements within <i>Gilberto and the Wind</i>. The teacher reads aloud the text while students listen for the characters within the story. Students Think-Pair-Share the Text Dependent Question (TDQ), “Do you think the Wind is a character? Why or why not? Use evidence from the text to support your answer.” Students then reread the text with a partner to identify the setting. Once the setting has been identified, students reread assigned sections of the book (Pages 2-7, 8-15, 16-21, or 22-28) to identify events that have happened in the story. From there students use their multiple rereads to retell the story with a partner and organize the events. In Module 4, Cinderella Stories, Lesson 14, students engage in multiple reads of the text, <i>Bigfoot Cinderrrrrella</i>. In the previous lesson, students determined that Ella is the main character of the story. In this</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>lesson, students determine why it “is important to pay attention to which character is telling the story at different points in the text” as they take a closer look at when Ella and other characters are speaking in the story. Students create and use character cards by writing “E” for Ella, “SS” for stepsisters, and “B” for Beary Godfather. The teacher instructs students to listen to the story and hold up the corresponding character cards each time Ella, the stepsisters, or the Beary Godfather speaks. The teacher reads aloud pages 11, 17, and 21 and shows the illustrations. Students follow along in their copies and identify when Ella, the stepsisters, and the Beary Godfather are speaking by holding up the appropriate character card. The teacher then rereads the sections on pages 11, 17, and 21 so students can analyze character traits and answer the following two Text-Dependent Questions: “On page 21, what were Ella’s actions? Use details from the illustrations and text to support your answer.” and “Based on her actions, what can you infer about Ella’s character traits? How would you describe her as a character?” Students reread and work in pairs to identify Ella’s actions using details from the text.</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 2. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> | <p>Required 2a) A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text-dependent and text-specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Each module has an Essential Question, which is</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| <p>Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | | | <p>addressed throughout the module and measured through module learning goals around knowledge, reading, speaking, listening, and writing. Additionally, within each module, lessons are structured into lesson sets with a Focusing Question that connects to the Essential Question of the lesson. Each lesson includes a Content Framing Question to further support students in developing knowledge and skills to respond to the module’s Essential Question. Further, questions within the lessons connect to the Essential Questions and are either text specific, requiring students to solely use the text to answer, or text-dependent, requiring students to cite evidence to support the idea. For example, in Module 1, A World of Books, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “How do books change lives around the world?” During Lessons 1-6, students engage with the text, <i>Tomas and the Library Lady</i>, to answer the Focusing Question, “How do library books change life for Tomas?” Then in Lessons 7-12, students engage with the text, <i>Waiting for the Biblioburro</i>, to answer the Focusing Question, “How does the Biblioburro change life for Ana?” Specifically, in Lesson 11, students compare and contrast characters in <i>Tomas and the Library Lady</i> and <i>Waiting for the Biblioburro</i>. Students work in pairs to answer various sets of questions specific to the text, such as the following: “How does Tomas get books?” “How does Ana get</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>books?” and “How is the way Tomas and Ana get books the same and different?” Students use their discussions to begin executing Focusing Question Task 2. In Module 4, Cinderella Stories, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “Why do people around the world admire Cinderella?” During Lessons 1-9, students engage with a variety of texts to answer the Focusing Question, “Why do people admire Perrault’s Cinderella?” In Lesson 3, students use the text, <i>Cinderella</i>, to answer questions such as, “Why couldn’t Cinderella go to the ball?” “What do Cinderella’s stepmother and stepsisters make her do?” and “Based off that evidence, how did her stepmother and stepsisters treat Cinderella?” In Lessons 10-16, students engage with a variety of texts to answer the Focusing Question, “Why do people admire Rough-Faced Girl and Ella?” Specifically, in Lesson 15, students identify key evidence and the central message. The teacher rereads pages 11, 13, 17, 21-22, and 29, and the students act out key evidence to help determine the central message. Students Think-Pair-Share the question, “Based on Ella’s actions we reviewed in the text, what lesson can we learn from Bigfoot Cinderrrrrella?” As a class, students create a central message for the text and identify evidence to support the central message. Students use their discussion and the evidence they have gathered to begin planning Focusing Question Task 2.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--|
| | <p>Required 2b) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. (Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. Questions and tasks use the language of standards while assessments or culminating tasks bridge multiple texts and advance student learning over the course of the units and term of study. Additionally, modules and lessons include learning goals that reflect the language of the standards. In Module 1, A World of Books, End of Module Task, students write and illustrate a narrative about a “character whose life has changed because of books.” Students include characters, a setting from <i>My Librarian is a Camel</i>, a problem, and a resolution to the problem. Students ensure that they include complete sentences that begin with a capital letter and end with a punctuation mark, include capital letters for proper nouns, and create illustrations to match the words on each page (RL.1.2, RL.1.3, W.1.3, W.1.8, SL.1.1a, L.1.1). In Lesson 29, begin executing their End of Module Tasks. Students use the How Children Get Books Sentence Chart to select evidence for their tasks. Students Think-Pair-Share various questions, such as, “Where will my story take place?” and “Who is the main character in your story?” to begin drafting their writing. The task is completed in the next lesson. In Module 2, Creature Features, Lesson 21, Deep Dive,</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>students identify frequently occurring prepositions (L.1.1.i). Students Think-Pair-Share, the question, “What did all my cards have in common during the silent game?” The teacher defines prepositions, and the class brainstorms a list of prepositions that students already know. The teacher echo reads the chart to ensure all students know the words. In partners, students look through the text to locate prepositions from the chart. When they find prepositions in the text, they mark them with a sticky note. In Module 4, Cinderella Stories, Lesson 34, students ask and answer questions using relevant details when speaking during a Socratic Seminar. The students focus on people, places, things, and events as they discuss why there are so many different versions of Cinderella stories (SL.1.2, SL.1.4, SL.1.6).</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 3. COHERENCE OF TASKS: Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed,</p> | <p>Required 3a) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. The materials build knowledge and skills in a thoughtful sequence across a series of questions aligned with a task or assessment to support students in making meaning of complex text. Each module includes multiple texts that are connected by theme or topic and focuses on an Essential Question for the Module, Focusing Questions for a series of lessons, and a Content Framing Question for</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| <p>so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | | | <p>each lesson. The Essential Question is posted for reference throughout the entire module as students incrementally build knowledge to answer the question by the end of the module. Each module contains a module map with sequenced activities and tasks in preparation for the End-of-Module Task. For example, in Module 2, Creature Feature, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “What can we discover about animals’ unique features?” The Focusing Question in Lessons 1-9 is, “What lessons can we learn through stories about animals?” In lesson 9, students work towards answering the question, “How Do <i>Aesop’s Fables</i> and <i>Seven Blind Mice</i> build my knowledge?” Students work together in a whole group to create a Knowledge Journal to discuss and record the lessons from <i>The Ants and the Grasshopper</i>, <i>The Hare and the Tortoise</i>, and <i>Seven Blind Mice</i>. Students Think-Pair-Share the following questions: “How did reading <i>Aesop’s Fables</i> build my knowledge?” “How did reading <i>Seven Blind Mice</i> build my knowledge?” “Think about the three fables we read. What is true of all of them?” and “What new information did we learn about the animals in the fables?” Students then complete their Knowledge Journal chart and identify what they learned from reading the fables. In Module 3, students begin building knowledge by reading <i>Feel the Wind</i>, an informational text that provides an introduction to the wind and how it is</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>created and affects people’s lives. Students culminate their learning at the end of Focusing Question Arc 1, by completing a mini-research project to investigate what hurricane winds can do. Later in the module, students encounter a different kind of power in emotions from the text, <i>Feelings</i>. Then students use their new knowledge to understand the emotional highs and lows of characters in three additional stories about the wind: <i>Gilberto and the Wind</i>; “<i>The Guest</i>,” a short story from Owl at Home; and <i>Brave Irene</i>. Finally, students learn about William Kamkwamba in <i>The Boy Who Harnessed the Wind</i>, a story about a real-life young inventor who builds windmills to combat drought in Malawi. Through this text, students learn how William harnesses wind power. Students explore wind power further as they study three windmill paintings by Piet Mondrian throughout the module. At the end of the module, students complete the End of Module Task in which they write a story about how a character from one of the module texts responds to the powerful force of the wind on a windy day.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3b) Questions and tasks are designed so that students build, apply, and integrate knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. In each module, reading, writing, and discussion pertaining to complex texts are provided and assist in students understanding and expressing their</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>understanding of the text. For example, in Module 2, Lesson 11, students engage in Think-Pair-Share to answer the question, “What do we need to remember when writing topic statements?” Then, the teacher distributes Handout 11B: Topic Statements. The teacher explains to students that both of the paragraphs on this handout are missing topic statements. Students work with a partner to determine the best topic statement for the paragraph. First, they underline key details and then discuss what the paragraph is mostly about. The teacher asks, “What do you know about key details?” Students echo read, and then chorally read the paragraph. Students underline key details first and, then, talk with a partner about what the text is mostly about. Students orally rehearse their topic statement with a partner before each student writes the topic statement for the paragraph. In Module 3, Lesson 29, students participate in a Socratic Seminar surrounding the text, <i>The Boy Who Harnessed the Wind</i> by William Kamkwamba and Bryan Mealer. Before beginning the seminar, students complete a Quick Write to answer the seminar question, “Is science or magic more important to William?” Students use the text and the Magic and Science T-Chart to cite evidence during the discussion. During the Land, students discuss whether their opinion changed during the seminar and they have the opportunity to explain why using evidence.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | <p>Required</p> <p>3c) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically related words, word families, etc.) rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. For example, in Module 4, Lesson 8, Deep Dive, the teacher instructs students to Think-Pair-Share to answer the question, “When you are shocked, how do you show this to your friends?” The teacher reminds students that shocked means to be really surprised, and sometimes even scared. The teacher also explains what gasping means. Students put words related to gasp on a word line and discuss how they are used in different ways to describe the actions of characters in the text. The teacher distributes word cards to partners that include the following words: breathe, gasp, shout, gulp. If needed, the teacher helps the students with the definition of the word. Students watch as each word is acted out and discuss what the word means before placing it on a word line. In Module 1, Lesson 22, the teacher displays the words, Cal and Lark, and the title, <i>That Book Woman</i>, and asks, “What are the different types of nouns we have studied?” The teacher reinforces that there are common and proper nouns and asks volunteers to</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>identify which type of nouns these three examples are, using prompting questions as needed. The teacher reinforces that these are proper nouns. Students Think-Pair-Share about words that describe each character. The teacher explains that adjectives can also be used to describe some of the common nouns in <i>That Book Woman</i>. The teacher shows students pages 7 and 8 of <i>That Book Woman</i> and asks students to tell the things they see on the page. The teacher begins making a list of the common nouns on the page, such as tree, dress, fence, hair, and cat. The teacher confirms that these words are nouns and nouns are people, places, and things. The teacher echo reads the words again and asks students to provide adjectives that could be added to these words to describe the common nouns. The teacher asks questions such as “What kind of cat do you see?” and “What size is the tree?” The teacher adds any new adjectives to the Adjectives Anchor Chart. Students complete Handout 22A: Adding Adjectives to Nouns independently. Students choose adjectives from the Adjectives Anchor Chart to add to the common nouns on the handout.</p> |
| Section II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Indicators (Grades K-5 only) | | | |
| Non-negotiable⁶ 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4a) Materials provide and follow a logical sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the | N/A | |

⁶ As applicable.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | standards (based on the Vertical Progression of Foundational Skills) while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills. | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only Indicator 4b)</p> <p>Materials provide grade-appropriate instruction and practice for the concepts of print (e.g., following words left to right, top to bottom, page by page; words are followed by spaces; and features of a sentence).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only 4c) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonological awareness instruction (e.g., recognizing rhyming words; clapping syllables; blending onset-rime; and blending, segmenting, deleting, and substituting phonemes).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4d) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonics instruction. Instruction progresses from simple to more complex sound–spelling patterns and word analysis skills that includes repeated modeling and opportunities for students to hear, say, write, and read sound and spelling patterns (e.g. sounds, words, sentences, reading within text).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only Indicator 4e) Materials provide multiple opportunities and practice for students to master grade appropriate high-frequency words using multisensory techniques.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4f) Resources and/or texts provide ample practice of foundational reading skills using texts (e.g. decodable readers) and allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of reading foundational skills, including phonics patterns and word analysis skills in decoding words.</p> | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4g) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and/or informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4h) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. (<i>Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.</i>) • In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns. | | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4i) Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring includes attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4j) Foundational Skills materials are abundant and easily implemented so that teachers can spend time, attention and practice with students who need foundational skills supports. | N/A | |
| Section III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality | | | |
| 5. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | Required 5a) Materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The majority of informational texts have an informational text structure. • In grades 3-12, narrative structure (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays) of informational text are also included. | | See EdReports for more information. |
| Required 5b) Materials include print and/or non-print texts in a variety of formats (e.g. a range of film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories, poetry, and novels). | | | |
| 5c) Additional materials provide direction and practice for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, | | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and develop knowledge of classroom concepts or topics. | | |
| <p>6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE: The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 6a) Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.⁷</p> <p>Required *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 6b) The majority of oral and written tasks require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p> <p>Required 6c) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s). • In grades 3-12, tasks may include blended modes (e.g., analytical writing). | | |

⁷ Technology and digital media may be used, when appropriate, to support the standards addressed in this indicator.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Required 6d) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own sentence construction as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage. | | |
| <p>7. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 7a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7b) Materials assess student understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the unit texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students demonstrate the knowledge and skill built over the course of the unit.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7d) Measurement of progress via assessments include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p> | | |
| <p>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below</p> | <p>Required 8a) As needed, pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>students with understanding the text itself (i.e. providing background knowledge, supporting vocabulary acquisition). Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of skills or strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts do not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8c) Materials include guidance and support that regularly directs teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading and discussion about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8d) Materials provide additional supports for expressing understanding through formal discussion and writing development (i.e. sentence frames, paragraph frames, modeled writing, student exemplars).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8e) Materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. Teacher editions are concise and easy to manage with clear connections between teacher resources. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8f) Support for English Learners and diverse learners is provided. Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level. The language in which questions and problems are posed is not an obstacle to understanding the content, and if it is, additional supports are included (e.g., alternative teacher approaches, pacing and instructional delivery</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--|
| | options, strategies or suggestions for supporting access to text and/or content, suggestions for modifications, suggestions for vocabulary acquisition, etc.). | | |
| | 8g) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. Materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take. | | |
| FINAL EVALUATION | | | |
| <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. | | | |
| <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. | | | |
| <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria. | | | |
| Compile the results for Sections I-III to make a final decision for the material under review. | | | |
| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
| I. K-12 Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality⁸ | 1. Quality of Texts | Yes | Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level, according to the requirements outlined in the standards. At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that |

⁸ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> |
| | 2. Text-Dependent Questions | Yes | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text-dependent and text-specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time.</p> |
| | 3. Coherence of Tasks | Yes | <p>Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. Questions and tasks support</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. |
| II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Criteria (grades K-5 only)⁹ | 4. Foundational Skills ¹⁰ | N/A | |
| III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality¹¹ | 5. Range and Volume of Texts | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 7. Assessments | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 8. Scaffolding and Support | | See EdReports for more information. |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier 1, Exemplifies quality | | | |

⁹ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

¹⁰ As applicable.

¹¹ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier 1 rating.



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **2**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-k-2>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**⁴ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II⁵ and all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-4 to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet **Non-Negotiable** Criteria 1-3 for the review to continue to Section III.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section III: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

⁴ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “Required” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

⁵ For grades K-5: Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2-3. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| <p>SECTION I. K-12 NON-NEGOTIABLE CRITERIA OF SUPERIOR QUALITY Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II and all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet all of the Non-Negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section III.</p> | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable 1. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 1a) Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A text analysis that includes complexity information is provided. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis, as well as reader and task considerations. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. • In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. The materials provide extensive read-aloud texts that allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. Each module includes a text complexity analysis in the Teacher Guide Appendix A. The standards alignment is listed along with the qualitative and quantitative measures. Anchor Texts within the four modules offer a range of fifteen informational texts and ten literary texts. The texts’ Lexile levels range from 300L to 1030L. For example, in Module 1, the poem, “Weather” by Eve Merriam, requires students to juggle alliteration, onomatopoeia, and real and nonsense words. Additionally, the informational text, <i>How Do You Know It’s Fall?</i> by Lisa M. Herrington, has a quantitative measurement of 650L. While the text is straightforward and provides information on seasonal changes in weather and fall activities, the text is complex due to its meaning and purposes as it uses challenging vocabulary and complex sentence structure. In this module, students also engage with the following texts: <i>A Color of His Own</i>, by Leo</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Lionni (640L); <i>Why Do Leaves Change Color</i>, by Betsy Maestro (580L); and <i>Sky Tree</i>, by Thomas Locker (490L). In Module 2, students engage with the text, <i>Journey of a Pioneer</i> by Patricia J. Murphy, which has a quantitative measure of 750L and is more complex than students could read themselves. Qualitative features include meaning and purpose that is an appropriate complexity level for the grade, events arranged in sequential order, use of photographs with captions, and the use of mostly grade-level appropriate vocabulary. In Module 3, students engage with the text, <i>I Have a Dream</i> (1030L). Although the text has a repetitive structure, it has rich academic language and high knowledge demands as well. In Module 3, students also read <i>The Story of Ruby Bridges</i>. A summary of the text is provided, along with the text’s Lexile level, which is 580–620L. Qualitatively, the text structure follows the sequence of events of Ruby’s first year at the integrated elementary school. The text’s meaning and purpose is to show readers how Ruby, a young girl, handled anger and hatred by staying calm and praying for those people. Language is assessed with recommendations to support students when reading this text due to the challenging vocabulary and complex sentence structure. The text demands a high level of knowledge with the need for discipline-specific information in order to fully comprehend the text.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | <p>Required Indicator 1b) At least 90% of provided texts, including read-alouds in K-2, are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. The texts are published independently of the materials and are mostly crafted for authentic, non-instructional purposes as seen in the rich language, engaging content, and high-quality and colorful illustrations supporting students' understanding of the text. For example, in Module 1, students examine seasonal differences and how change impacts characters in well-crafted texts through character study by recognizing how people change. Study in this module exposes students to knowledge that students will encounter, such as changes in the text and in their lives. Students first study through multisensory exploration of the poem "Weather" by Eve Merriam, along with four fine art paintings, including the following: Paris Street, Rainy Day, by Gustave Caillebotte; Hunters in the Snow by Pieter Brugel the Elder; Bathers at Asnieres, by George Seurat; and Autumn Landscape by Maurice de Vlaminck. Students notice and wonder how change is represented and described in poetry and art. In <i>Sky Tree</i>, paintings are paired with language that depicts the four seasons, which highlight the cycle of change in nature. Module 2 contains three informational texts and five literary</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>texts, all of which are published independently of the materials. In Module 2, Lessons 16-19, students read <i>The Legend of Bluebonnet</i> by the award-winning author, Tomie dePaola. This culturally rich text provides students an opportunity to learn new academic vocabulary, discover the meaning of new words using context clues, and explore a central message through character analysis and the events of the story. In Module 4, students engage with the text, <i>The Vegetables We Eat</i> by leading author and illustrator, Gail Gibbons. In this nonfiction text, students explore good nutrition through the discovery of different kinds of vegetables. This information text includes a multitude of illustrations, diagrams, and information about produce.</p> |
| | <p>Required 1c) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex texts. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Each module includes read-aloud texts to ensure that all students build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text while developing essential skills. For example in Module 1, A Season of Change, students engage with connected texts to build knowledge and collect evidence to answer the Essential Question, “How does change impact people and nature?” The connected texts in this module include the poem, “Weather,” the literary texts, <i>The</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>Little Yellow Leaf</i> and <i>A Color of Its Own</i>, and the informational texts, <i>How Do You Know it's Fall?</i>, <i>Why do Leaves Change Color?</i>, and <i>Sky Tree</i>. By the end of this module, students write to inform their readers about the impact of change and the impact it has on plants and animals. In Module 2, <i>The America West</i>, students engage with a variety of texts to answer the Essential Question, "What was life like in the West for early Americans?" The core texts used in the module are a combination of informational and literary texts that connect topics and ideas from multiple lessons. The informational texts include <i>The Buffalo Are Back</i>, <i>Journey of a Pioneer</i>, and <i>Plains Indians</i>. The literary texts include <i>Johnny Appleseed</i>, <i>John Henry: An American Legend</i>, <i>John Henry</i>, <i>The Legend of Bluebonnet</i>, and <i>The Story of Johnny Appleseed</i>. Students use the texts to build knowledge throughout the module in preparation for the End of Module Task in which they write an informative paragraph using evidence from the texts to compare Johnny Appleseed or John Henry to the lives of real pioneers. Additionally, students share their knowledge of the growth that emerged from the struggles of early settlers in the American West. In Module 3, <i>Civil Rights Heroes</i>, students examine the impact of three key Civil Rights heroes: Martin Luther King Jr, Ruby Bridges, and Sylvia Mendez by focusing on the Essential Question, "How can people respond to injustice?" Students examine</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>these three individuals in America and build knowledge around what it means to live out the nation’s creed of “liberty and justice for all.” Students explore a series of narrative nonfiction texts, such as <i>I Have a Dream</i>, <i>Martin Luther King, Jr. and the March on Washington</i>, <i>Ruby Bridges Goes to School</i>, <i>The Story of Ruby Bridges</i>, and <i>Separate is Never Equal: Sylvia Mendez and Her Family’s Fight for Desegregation</i>. Students also engage with poems, such as “Words like Freedom” and “Dream,” as well as videos, such as “Civil Rights - Ruby Bridges” and “The Man Who Changed America.” Students engage with the core and supplementary texts to examine how words have the power to inspire change and the power of individuals to unite others in the fight against injustice. Students examine texts from the point of view of Ruby Bridges and explore narrative writing that details thoughts, feelings, and actions.</p> |
| | <p>Required 1d) Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. The texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building. Repeated readings occur frequently throughout the materials to support knowledge building amongst connected topics or texts and have specific purposes. For example, in the collection of texts in Module 2, The American West, students discover how the actions of American Indians and the early Americans impacted</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>the prairie in the American West. Students engage in multiple readings of the narrative nonfiction text, <i>The Buffalo Are Back</i> in Lessons 1-5. In Lesson 1, during and after the first read, students ask and answer questions about the text. In Lesson 2, students reread to retell the main topic and key events from the text and identify shades of meaning among related verbs in the text. In Lesson 3, they reread to describe the relationships between the people, plants, and animals and categorize academic words. In Lesson 4, students reread to determine the central message of the text. Finally, in Lesson 5, students write an informative paragraph using the understanding they gained from the text, specific vocabulary they developed, and correct paragraph structure. In Module 3, Civil Rights Heroes, Lessons 19-23, students engage in multiple and careful readings of the text, <i>The Story of Ruby Bridges</i> as they investigate the Focusing Question, “How did Ruby Bridges respond to injustice?” While reading this text for the first time, students develop and discuss questions. In Lesson 20, students recount the text, including story elements, and distinguish shades of meaning among related sets of adjectives. In Lesson 21, students reread to understand the different points of view of two characters in the text. In the next lesson, students determine the essential message of the text. Lastly, in Lesson 23, students respond in writing to</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met)</p> <p>2. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> <p>Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>2a) A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>express their understanding of the text they have repeatedly read during the week.</p> <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text-dependent and text-specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Each module has an Essential Question, which is addressed throughout the module and measured through module learning goals around knowledge, reading, speaking, listening, and writing. Additionally, within each module, lessons are structured into lesson sets with a Focusing Question that connects to the Essential Question of the lesson. Each lesson includes a Content Framing Question to further support students in developing knowledge and skills to respond to the module’s Essential Question. Further, questions within the lessons connect to the Essential Questions and are either text specific, requiring students to solely use the text to answer, or text-dependent, requiring students to cite evidence to support the idea. For example, in Module 1, A Season of Change, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “How does change impact people and nature?” During Lessons 10-14, students engage with the text, <i>The Little Yellow Leaf</i>, to answer the Focusing Question, “How does Little Yellow Leaf Change?” Specifically, in Lesson 12, students use the text, <i>The Little Yellow Leaf</i>, as they engage in a Think-Pair-Share to answer questions that describe the character’s actions at the beginning and the</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>end of the story. Students read aloud the beginning and end of the text and then Think-Pair-Share the following Text-Dependent Questions (TDQ): “Describe the Little Yellow Leaf’s actions in the beginning.” “Describe the Little Yellow Leaf’s actions in the ending.” and “How were the Little Yellow Leaf’s actions different in the beginning and ending?” As students discuss, the Change Chart for The Little Yellow Leaf is completed, and students also use their discussions to Stop and Jot an answer to the question, “What caused the change in the Little Yellow Leaf’s actions?” In Module 4, Good Eating, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “How does food nourish us?” In Lessons 22-27, students engage with the text, <i>Good Enough to Eat</i>, and <i>Cakes</i>, and the infographic, “Eating Your A, B, C’s” to answer the Focusing Question, “How can I choose nourishing foods?” In Lesson 23, Deep Dive: Vocabulary, students read pages 10-11 of the text, <i>Good Enough to Eat</i>, to answer the questions, “Why do our bodies need food?” and “What does it mean that food ‘energizes’ your body?” In Lesson 25, students examine the infographic “Eating Your A, B, C’s” to answer Text Specific Questions such as, “How is an infographic organized?” and “What vitamin is the picture of the fruit or vegetable listed under?” Students Think-Pair-Share to discuss their ideas. Students use their discussion and the Research Sources Chart</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | to collect evidence for Focusing Question Task 4. Students complete their Evidence Organizer by rereading the text and identifying the fruit or vegetable, the vitamin within the fruit or vegetable, and how the vitamin keeps the body healthy. During the Land, students Mix and Mingle the Content Framing Question, “What is happening in the ‘Eating your A, B, C’S’ infographic?” |
| | <p>Required 2b) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. (Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</p> | Yes | <p>Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. Questions and tasks use the language of standards while assessments or culminating tasks bridge multiple texts and advance student learning over the course of the units and term of study. Additionally, modules and lessons include learning goals that reflect the language of the standards. The sequencing and unfolding of questions and tasks advance learning for students. For example, in Module 1, A Season of Change, students work towards answering the Essential Question, “How does change impact people and nature?” In Lesson 3, students Think-Pair-Share or Stop and Jot in their Knowledge Journals to identify important facts about change and seasons and cite evidence from the text, “Weather,” and pieces of visual art (RL.2.1). Additionally, students recognize important words in</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>“Weather” (RF.2.4), such as performance, bumper, and barrel, as they complete Handout 3A: Fluency Key Words. During the Deep Dive, students discuss words from the lesson, including windowpane, outside, landscape, and rainstorm, to develop an understanding of compound words and how to use the meaning of individual words to predict the meaning of the compound words (L.2.4.d, L2.4.e). After exploring the texts and module vocabulary in the remaining lessons of the unit, students collaboratively complete the End of Module Task by writing an informative paragraph on the impact of fall on people and nature. This culminates the learning that is developed throughout the module and addresses RI.2.2 and W.2.2. In Module 2, The American West, Lesson 34 End of Module Task, students write an informative paragraph to explain their answer to the question, “How was one legendary person (John Henry or Johnny Appleseed) different from real-life pioneers?” The lesson demonstrates the advancement of student learning over the course of units and terms of study as students utilize their knowledge from three different texts to answer the prompt (RI.2.2, RL.2.2, W.2.2, and W.2.8). In Module 4, Lesson 16, students participate in a Socratic Seminar to compare and contrast the texts, <i>Stone Soup</i> and <i>Bone Button Borscht</i>. Students identify key ideas or details to recount from the module texts they read. Students discuss the similarities and</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met)</p> <p>3. COHERENCE OF TASKS: Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>3a) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>differences between the two stories and use formal language in their discussions (SL.2.1, SL.2.2, RL.2.1, L.2.1.c).</p> <p>Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. The materials build knowledge and skills in a thoughtful sequence across a series of questions aligned with a task or assessment to support students in making meaning of complex text. Each module includes multiple texts that are connected by theme or topic and focuses on an Essential Question for the Module, Focusing Questions for a series of lessons, and a Content Framing Question for each lesson. The Essential Question is posted for reference throughout the entire module as students incrementally build knowledge to answer the question by the end of the module. Each module contains a module map with sequenced activities and tasks in preparation for the End-of-Module Task. For example, throughout Module 2, The American West, students explore the Essential Question, “What was life like in the West for early Americans?” To begin their discovery, students read <i>The Buffalo Are Back</i>, looking closely at events connected in history that show how people and nature are bridged together. Students engage with the poem, “Buffalo Dusk,” to gain a</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>perception of living in the West at that time in history. Students continue building knowledge by reading the text <i>Plain Indians</i> and <i>Journey of a Pioneer</i>, a first-person account of traveling the Oregon Trail. For each of these four texts, students spend time in five lessons each for each of the texts conducting close reads. Students reread for different purposes allowing them to thoughtfully understand the text content and language and the author’s purpose and style, and to make deep connections. Next, students analyze the text for life lessons as they read legendary stories, such as <i>John Henry</i> and <i>Johnny Appleseed</i>. In the End of Module Task, students communicate in writing to compare one of the legends to the life of a real-life pioneer using their knowledge gained in the module including evidence from the texts they read. In Module 4, students explore the Essential Question, “How does food nourish us?” As students begin their discovery of the impact healthy food can have on their lives, they learn about the digestive system in close readings of informational texts and shared research about the organs relating to this system. Students ask and answer questions, discuss, and write as they gain information and deepen their understanding by close reading for different purposes in each lesson. Next, students gain an understanding of healthy food choices, how to grow their own food, and the nutrients in food that nourish the body, through the questions and</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | tasks relating to the text, <i>The Vegetables We Eat</i> and <i>Good Enough to Eat</i> . The task at the end of the module provides students an opportunity to reflect on the knowledge they have learned and share their opinions with others through writing and a Socratic Seminar. |
| | <p>Required 3b) Questions and tasks are designed so that students build, apply, and integrate knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts.</p> | Yes | <p>Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. In each module, reading, writing, and discussion pertaining to complex texts are provided and assist in students understanding and expressing their understanding of the text. For example, in Module 1, Lesson 7, students engage with the text, <i>How Do You Know It's Fall? As</i> students read this text, they express their understanding in ways that allow them to develop their reading, writing, listening, and language skills. Students determine the main topics in each section of the text and then find connections between the ideas to identify the main idea of the text. Students Think-Pair-Share to first respond orally and then write their response in their Response Journal. Throughout this group of lessons, in small groups, students discuss changes in the fall using sentence stems to build on each other's ideas and learn how to link their comments together. In Module 3, students develop their speaking and listening skills by listening for a main topic and how to speak on the topic in text or</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>conversation. Students ask questions to gather information on a topic to deepen their understanding and participate in Socratic Seminars. Moreover, the lessons are built to teach students how to focus on skills during Socratic seminars. In the first Socratic Seminar, students discuss the power of Martin Luther King Jr’s words. For example, in Lesson 13, students use the text, “I Have a Dream,” to participate in a Socratic Seminar. Students read the Socratic Seminar opening question, “Why were Martin Luther King Jr.’s words powerful?” In order to answer this question, students think about the question and collect evidence from the text.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3c) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically related words, word families, etc.) rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. For example, in Module 2, Lesson 2, students engage in identifying words and their relationships. In the Examine Topic-Specific Words section of the lesson, the teacher begins by guiding students to determine the meaning of unknown words by replacing topic-specific words with general words. The sentence with general words reads, “With the death</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>of the animals, the fights were over. The people faced a new fight - the fight of the plants.” The sentence with topic-specific words reads, “With the death of the buffalo, the Indian Wars were over. The settlers faced a new fight - the battle of the grasses.” The teacher asks students which sentence they understood more clearly and why. The teacher guides the students through another example and completes the lesson by asking how the topic-specific words make sentences better. In Module 4, Lesson 2 students use a glossary and beginning dictionary to determine or clarify the meaning of the word esophagus. The teacher distributes copies of <i>The Digestive System</i> written by Christine Taylor-Butler. In pairs, students gather information about the word esophagus on pages 12 and 13, including its meaning. The teacher asks more questions about the word esophagus and instructs students to look up the word esophagus in the text glossary and share what they found from their beginning dictionary. Students compare the dictionary to the glossary. This practice is repeated using other words. Sentence frames are provided to support the usage of the vocabulary as well.</p> |
| Section II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Indicators (Grades K-5 only) | | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4a) Materials provide and follow a logical sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards (based on the Vertical Progression of Foundational</p> | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>Non-negotiable⁶</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Skills) while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only Indicator 4b) Materials provide grade-appropriate instruction and practice for the concepts of print (e.g., following words left to right, top to bottom, page by page; words are followed by spaces; and features of a sentence).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only 4c) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonological awareness instruction (e.g., recognizing rhyming words; clapping syllables; blending onset-rime; and blending, segmenting, deleting, and substituting phonemes).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4d) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonics instruction. Instruction progresses from simple to more complex sound–spelling patterns and word analysis skills that includes repeated modeling and opportunities for students to hear, say, write, and read sound and spelling patterns (e.g. sounds, words, sentences, reading within text).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only Indicator 4e) Materials provide multiple opportunities and practice for students to master grade appropriate high-frequency words using multisensory techniques.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4f) Resources and/or texts provide ample practice of foundational reading skills using texts (e.g. decodable readers) and allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of reading foundational skills, including phonics patterns and word analysis skills in decoding words.</p> | N/A | |

⁶ As applicable.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4g) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and/or informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4h) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. (<i>Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.</i>) • In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns. | | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4i) Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring includes attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4j) Foundational Skills materials are abundant and easily implemented so that teachers can spend time, attention and practice with students who need foundational skills supports. | N/A | |
| Section III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality | | | |
| <p>5. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 5a) Materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The majority of informational texts have an informational text structure. • In grades 3-12, narrative structure (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays) of informational text are also included. | | See EdReports for more information. |
| <p>Required 5b) Materials include print and/or non-print texts in a variety of formats (e.g. a range of film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories, poetry, and novels).</p> | | | |
| <p>5c) Additional materials provide direction and practice for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina,</p> | | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and develop knowledge of classroom concepts or topics. | | |
| <p>6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE: The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 6a) Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.⁷</p> <p>Required *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 6b) The majority of oral and written tasks require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p> <p>Required 6c) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s). • In grades 3-12, tasks may include blended modes (e.g., analytical writing). | | |

⁷ Technology and digital media may be used, when appropriate, to support the standards addressed in this indicator.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Required 6d) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own sentence construction as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage. | | |
| <p>7. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 7a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7b) Materials assess student understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the unit texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students demonstrate the knowledge and skill built over the course of the unit.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7d) Measurement of progress via assessments include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p> | | |
| <p>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below</p> | <p>Required 8a) As needed, pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>students with understanding the text itself (i.e. providing background knowledge, supporting vocabulary acquisition). Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of skills or strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts do not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8c) Materials include guidance and support that regularly directs teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading and discussion about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8d) Materials provide additional supports for expressing understanding through formal discussion and writing development (i.e. sentence frames, paragraph frames, modeled writing, student exemplars).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8e) Materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. Teacher editions are concise and easy to manage with clear connections between teacher resources. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8f) Support for English Learners and diverse learners is provided. Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level. The language in which questions and problems are posed is not an obstacle to understanding the content, and if it is, additional supports are included (e.g., alternative teacher approaches, pacing and instructional delivery</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--|
| | options, strategies or suggestions for supporting access to text and/or content, suggestions for modifications, suggestions for vocabulary acquisition, etc.). | | |
| | 8g) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. Materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take. | | |
| FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria. | | | |
| Compile the results for Sections I-III to make a final decision for the material under review. | | | |
| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
| I. K-12 Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality ⁸ | 1. Quality of Texts | Yes | Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level, according to the requirements outlined in the standards. At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that |

⁸ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> |
| | 2. Text-Dependent Questions | Yes | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text-dependent and text-specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time.</p> |
| | 3. Coherence of Tasks | Yes | <p>Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. Questions and tasks support</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. |
| II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Criteria (grades K-5 only)⁹ | 4. Foundational Skills ¹⁰ | N/A | |
| III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality¹¹ | 5. Range and Volume of Texts | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 7. Assessments | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 8. Scaffolding and Support | | See EdReports for more information. |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier 1, Exemplifies quality | | | |

⁹ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

¹⁰ As applicable.

¹¹ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier 1 rating.



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **3**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-3-8>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**⁴ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II⁵ and all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-4 to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet **Non-Negotiable** Criteria 1-3 for the review to continue to Section III.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section III: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

⁴ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “Required” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

⁵ For grades K-5: Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2-3. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| <p>SECTION I. K-12 NON-NEGOTIABLE CRITERIA OF SUPERIOR QUALITY</p> <p>Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II and all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet all of the Non-Negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section III.</p> | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable</p> <p>1. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>1a) Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A text analysis that includes complexity information is provided. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis, as well as reader and task considerations. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. • In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Anchor texts placed within the four, Grade 3 modules offer a range of seven literary and twelve informational picture book reading opportunities. The majority of texts fall between 470-1090 Lexile, as identified by quantitative measures. Eight of the nineteen overall anchor texts extend past the Grade 3 420-820 Lexile band. However, three of these texts have Lexiles categorized under adult directed (AD) which appear in the last module, meaning the entirety of the text is read aloud. The remaining five texts are utilized for guided, repeated readings primarily focusing on imagery connections and gradually building knowledge over the module. Qualitative measures for above-level texts are accessible to students with teacher support. Therefore, texts that students are responsible for independently reading are complex, yet age-appropriate. In Module 1, students read the informational text <i>Ocean Sunlight: How Tiny Plants Feed the Seas</i>, by Molly Bang and Penny Chisholm. Qualitative analysis deems this to be moderately complex. This rating is due to the simplistic text structure, supplementary</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>graphics, and limited knowledge demands based on directly defined information; yet it offers an extensive domain-specific vocabulary and a lyrical, prose-type writing style that could pose a potential challenge to readers of this age. This text is categorized as a non-conforming (NC1090) Lexile, meaning that it is geared toward high readers needing age-appropriate content. This text is utilized as a guided repeated reading and includes the following: teacher read-aloud, illustration exploration, and modeled note taking. In Module 1, students also read an insightful narrative informational text entitled <i>Shark Attack!</i> by Cathy East Dubowski. When utilizing the text complexity rubric, it can be categorized as moderately complex. This is based upon the use of tier two and tier three language that requires teacher support, as well as easily accessible written structure that uses a majority of simple and compound sentences. This text is at a Lexile level of 820 which is at the highest point of the grade band and can be read independently by students; however, teachers offer supports within the module to promote a clear understanding of the text. In Module 2, students read <i>One Giant Leap: A Historical Account of the First Moon Landing</i>, by Robert Burleigh. This text (470L) falls within the lower range of the Grade 3 quantitative Lexile band. Qualitative analysis determines the text as slightly complex. The author is visual in word choice offering instances of</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>figurative language; however, this does not deter students' understanding. Where the chronological structure can be easily comprehended by students, slightly abstract topics that come with space could summon difficulties. This text is prescribed with teacher read-aloud and lesson supports; therefore students will be capable of reading this independently when assigned. In Module 3, students read the literary text <i>The Keeping Quilt</i>, by Patricia Polacco. Quantitatively this text falls outside of the 2-3 Lexile grade band as it is listed at a 920L. Qualitative analysis deems this to be moderately complex. This moderate rating is based on a straightforward chronological structure, Russian cultural terms that unless otherwise defined could prove to be challenging, as well as the background knowledge concerning immigrants that students may be lacking. This text is thoroughly read and modeled by the teacher. Students delve into the text on numerous occasions after listening aloud. Students are independently capable of completing tasks based on this. In Module 4, students read the literary text <i>Alvin Ailey</i>, by Andrea Davis Pinkney (AD880L). This anchor text is listed as an adult directed (AD) meaning adult read-aloud is essential for understanding. Qualitative analysis deems this to be moderately complex. The biographical narrative offers a chronological timeline of events, it exhibits numerous pieces of figurative language and</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>cultural/spiritual background that students may have not experienced before. This text is dense; however, it is read aloud and chunked by the teacher throughout lessons to ensure focus on skills. Overall, anchor and supporting texts are appropriately complex. Modules consistently incorporate quantitatively above-level texts that provide higher language and, in some cases, knowledge demands. However, when introduced, texts are fluently read aloud and modeled by the teacher. When repeatedly exploring texts, teachers are prescribed to chunk various sections to promote full comprehension and understanding prior to independently working.</p> |
| | <p>Required Indicator 1b) At least 90% of provided texts, including read-alouds in K-2, are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. All four modules include literary and informational texts related to the module central focus, or topic. Eleven of the nineteen core texts offered are critically acclaimed pieces of writing, or have been written by award-winning authors. Texts have been selected with discipline oriented expertise in mind. Students gain information from knowledgeable sources throughout. In Module 1: The Sea, Lessons 4-7, students are introduced to the oceanic ecosystem by reading the informational text <i>Ocean</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>Sunlight: How Tiny Plants Feed the Seas</i>, by acclaimed Caldecott artist, Molly Bang, and award-winning M.I.T. scientist, Penny Chisholm. During this reading, students gather that whether on land, or at sea, the world is fully connected from a leading expert on oceans. In Module 2: Outer Space, Lessons 27-28, students read the science fiction text entitled <i>Zathura</i>, by Chris Van Allsburg, an acclaimed writer with two Caldecott medal winning publications. This text encompasses mythical, intergalactic adventure while providing considerations to space and its vast possibilities. In Module 3: A New Home, Lessons 1-6 and 13-14, students read the 1994 Caldecott award winner “Grandfather’s Journey,” by Allen Say, to investigate immigration through the story of a grandfather’s love for two locations. Allen Say is also highlighted again in this module with a paired text following similar characters with differing perspectives. In Module 4: Artists Make Art, Lessons 29-30, students focus on biographical narratives related to famous artistic figures in history. The Sibert Honor Book, New York Times Best Book of the Year, and Publishers Weekly Best Book of the Year, <i>Action Jackson</i>, by Jan Greenburg, Sandra Jordan, and Robert Andrew Parker, is emphasized in this module as it provides background knowledge into the life of Jackson Pollock. Overall, each of the four modules offers students a deep dive into various genres and author perspectives</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|---|
| | <p>Required</p> <p>1c) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex texts. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. | Yes | <p>surrounding the central theme. Students are provided publishable, award-winning, quality text that allows for opportunities to demonstrate mastery of ELA standards.</p> <p>Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Each of the four, Grade 3 modules provides various learning opportunities that build through the use of lesson arcs. Within these arcs, learning is centered around Focus Questions which pave a learning path toward answering the overall Essential Question during the End-of-Module Task. Students are supported appropriately depending on the complexity of the texts. For example, in Module 1: The Sea, students progress through three lesson arcs centered around Focus Questions. Each Focus Question builds and prepares students for a written essay delving into “Why people explore the sea?” as the End-of-Module Task. For example, Arc 1, Focus Question 1, Lessons 1-9, students are guided by the Focus Question: How do artists explore the sea? Students begin their exploration of the sea by analyzing poetry and art. Students observe (notice/wonder) and discuss central messages for works such as: “The Sea Wind,” by Sara Teasdale, “The Great Wave,” by Katsushika Hokusai, and “The Boating Party,” by Mary Cassatt. This introduction of art and poetry offer differing</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>perspectives of the sea which promote a sense of mystery and wonder. These opportunities instill speaking and listening through repeated whole-group and small-group discussion. Various discussion settings are used to teach students to agree/disagree effectively and create understanding of artistic, figurative word choice through documentation of language skills in student knowledge journals. These tasks are modeled consistently by the teacher. Toward the end of this arc, students embark on analyzing the text <i>Amos & Boris</i>, by William Steig, through an I do, we do, you do model. Students listen and repeatedly read this text of unlikely friendships noticing word choice pertaining to the sea, organization, and central message. Finally, students then utilize their central message findings to determine how artists explore the sea and how their work adds to the viewers' understanding of the sea. This is accomplished through a written paragraph to be presented in a whole group Socratic Seminar. In Arc 2, Focus Question 2, Lessons 10-18, students are guided by the following Focus Question: Why and how do scientists explore the sea? Students listen and navigate through two complex informational texts "Ocean Sunlight: How Tiny Plants Feed the Sea," by Molly Bang and Penny Chisholm, and <i>The Fantastic Undersea Life of Jacques Cousteau</i>, by Dan Yaccarino. This deep analysis of scientific wording, related information grouping and</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>illustrations aid students in the overall meaning, or the main idea, of each text. Students repeatedly read and gather information by asking/answering questions through whole group and small-group discussion, as well as written expression. Finally, students then utilize their main idea findings from both informational texts to determine how and why scientists explore the sea. This is accomplished through an explanatory writing task utilizing informational skills observed through text and language practice. In Arc 3, Focus Question 3, Lessons 19-30, students are guided by the following Focus Question: Why and how do scientists explore sea creatures? Students listen and practice fluently reading the informational texts <i>Shark Attack</i> by Kathy East Dubowski and <i>Giant Squid: Searching for a Sea Monster</i> by Mary M. Cerullo and Clyde F.E. Roper. Within this arc, students follow a similar pattern of observation, organization analysis, word choice, and overall meaning. Students do this through an I do, we do, you do framework. Students steadily practice reading fluently with partners and conduct group discussions based on information gathered. At the end of this arc, students utilize their main idea findings from both informational texts to determine how and why scientists explore sea creatures. This is accomplished through an explanatory writing task utilizing informational skills observed through text and language</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>practice. However, during this arc there is an emphasis on revision with peer feedback. Overall, each of the four modules builds knowledge steadily across lessons through the use of reading, writing, speaking and language and do so in a way that is grade-level appropriate. Students are introduced to main ideas and central themes of the sea through visuals/modeling. Once students are comfortable with this focus, they are able to repeat the same learning structure with more complex informational texts, all of which are accumulating domain-specific vocabulary and content knowledge of the sea. Each of these arcs assists in accomplishing the end of the module essay goal and culminating student understanding of undersea life.</p> |
| | <p>Required 1d) Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. Texts within the four, Grade 3 modules provide ample opportunities to engage in careful literary, or informational, study across four to five consecutive lessons. For example, in Module 1, The Seas: students read the anchor text <i>Amos & Boris</i>. Students are prompted to reread a portion of the text to answer text dependent questions and discover inferences based on evidence with partners/small groups. In Lesson 5, students read page 5 to determine answers to the following questions: “What story elements do you notice in this passage?” “How does your knowledge of</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Amos' character and the setting help clarify the meaning of the word overwhelmed?" and "How do the words and illustrations explaining Amos' attempts to catch the <i>Rodent</i> clarify the meaning of the word desperately?" Later, in Lesson 7, the students in each group review <i>Amos & Boris</i> to complete the story map from Lesson 5. Students do this by explaining how the story elements express a central message. In Module 2, Outer Space: students read the core text <i>Starry Messenger</i>, by Peter Sis. Students are prompted to reread the text to determine the sequential timeline. For example, in Lesson 4, teacher guidance states, "Students reread <i>Starry Messenger</i>... Students select eight to twelve events from the life of Galileo and record each of them on a separate index card." Students then place these index cards in chronological order. Later in Lesson 5, students reread <i>Starry Messenger</i> focusing on cause and effect relationships. Students search for these relationships within the text in small groups. In Module 3, A New Home: students read the central text <i>Coming to America</i>, by Betsy Maestro. This text is focused primarily on informational text features which support the message of the text. In Lesson 19, students review the illustrations on pages 22-29 of <i>Coming to America</i>. Students utilize this information to determine feelings of individuals using the images along with text evidence to support their thinking. Later, in Lesson 23, students reread to</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>collect evidence from illustrations on pages 22-23. Students utilize individuals in the images to write a letter from their perspective to someone in their home country. Students use text evidence and reasoning which was learned through previous lessons. In Module 4, Artists Make Art: students read to learn about the lives of acclaimed artists. One such text is <i>Action Jackson</i>, by Jan Greenburg and Sandra Jordan. In Lesson 22, students review <i>Action Jackson</i> to search for direct quotations from Pollock and have collaborative conversations about how one specific quotation helps to understand the artist in greater depth. In Lesson 29, students utilize two core texts <i>Action Jackson</i> and <i>When Marian Sang</i>, by Pam Munoz Ryan. Students use texts to identify two character traits, as well as supporting evidence for each artist. Students complete a comparison graphic organizer in preparation for a group discussion. Overall, students revisit texts throughout each module. Students utilize module texts for necessary knowledge building, evidence gathering and expressing understanding through lesson written expression, as well as the End-of-Module Writing Task. Each module has a clear, complex text progression using a gradual release model. Students listen to a fluent reader, practice fluent reading themselves, reread for understanding, and reread for evidence collection.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met)</p> <p>2. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> <p>Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>2a) A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Lessons are structured in the same manner within each module: Welcome, Launch, Learn, Land, and Wrap. Students are provided text dependent questions (TDQs) steadily over the course of the four modules, especially within the learn segment of each lesson. Students answer TDQs within a think-pair-share response model toward the beginning of each learning segment, as well as toward the end within small group or independent work to express overall understanding. For example, in Module 1: The Sea, Lesson 14, students read <i>The Fantastic Undersea Life of Jacques Cousteau</i> and respond to questions such as, “What do the illustrations on page 4 and 31 suggest about how Dan Yaccarino organized the text in <i>The Fantastic Undersea Life of Jacques Cousteau</i>?” and “On page 5, the author says, ‘Jacques also loved to tinker, and build all kinds of gadgets.’ What does tinker mean in this sentence? Use details from the text and illustration to explain.” Later in the module, students read <i>Shark Attack!</i> In Lesson 20, students answer TDQs within a think-pair-share discussion framework. These questions include: “What do you think the word choices in the first paragraph on page 16 suggest about the main idea of the paragraph?” “How do the illustrations and captions on page 16 support the main idea of the first</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>paragraph?” and “What is the main idea of the second paragraph on page 16 and what details support the idea?” In Module 2: Outer Space, Lesson 5, students read <i>Starry Messenger</i>, by Peter Sis. Within the learn segment of the lesson, students participate in peer discussions and answer the following question verbally: “Based on the illustrations on pages 4-5, what can you infer about the effect of Copernicus’s decision to observe the sky?” Shortly after in Lesson 7, students practice peer discussions again by carefully rereading <i>Starry Messenger</i>. Students answer “What is the most important idea on pages 8-9? How do the text, illustrations, and script passage work together to support this idea?” verbally with a partner. In Module 3: A New Home, Lesson 27, students are presented two passages from the text <i>Tea with Milk</i> one of which offers dialogue between characters and the other does not to prompt discussion over the importance of dialogue in narrative writing. Students then provide a written response to the prompt, “What do we learn about May and Joseph from the dialogue in this passage?” in their response journals. In Lesson 34, students answer the overall module Essential Question, How do stories help us understand immigrants’ experiences? by completing the End-of-Module Task. This task asks students to select one moment from a module text and write a narrative from the perspective of the main character using evidence to support it. In Module 4:</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Artists Make Art, Lesson 5, students notice the author's organization through verbally responding to the following TDQ: "Review the chapter headings in <i>Alvin Ailey</i>, How does Andrea Davis Pinkney organize the information in this book?" In Lesson 8, students research by utilizing their knowledge from the two following sources: <i>Alvin Ailey</i>, by Andrea Davis Pinkney, and the back biographical matter from <i>Alvin Ailey</i>. Students answer the following question: "What inspired Alvin Ailey? Use information that you gathered in your digital organizer and your research note catcher." Overall, within these four modules, students engage with text dependent questions daily whether they are being answered verbally, or written. Students answer in whole group, small groups, or in partner discussion settings such as think-pair-share. Students steadily answer written lesson questions in their response journal, which is then utilized for the end of module writing. Students build knowledge throughout aimed toward the module Focus Question.</p> |
| | <p>Required 2b) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. (Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. For example, in Module 1: The Sea, Lesson 2, students focus on the central message with the help of vocabulary by answering the following question in their response journals: "Use domain-specific</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>vocabulary from the lesson to explain how key details help express a central message in “The Great Wave.” (RL3.2, L3.6). In Module 2: Outer Space, Lesson 21, students determine the use of literal and non-literal language in a text. This skill is used to analyze Neil Armstrong's <i>One Giant Leap</i> quotation. Students answer the question: “How is this quotation an example of literal or nonliteral language? How does the non-literal language deepen your understanding of the Apollo 11 mission?” (L.3.5.a, W.3.1). Students use non-literal language evidence collected from sticky notes in <i>One Giant Leap</i> to respond as an opinion writing piece in their response journals. At the end of the module, students create an essay that can be posted on a classroom website. This essay post is to be focused on space which answers this question, “In your opinion, what is the most important thing people have done to learn about space?” Success criteria are provided to students in a rubric format to demonstrate what an opinion essay must have to show mastery (W3.1.a-d). Students practiced opinion based writing in previous lessons; therefore, they are accustomed to the standards based language. In Module 3: A New Home, Lesson 4, students read <i>Grandfather’s Journey</i>, by Allen Say. Students focus on the narrator point of view to answer the following question: “Based on the text, what is the narrator’s point of view about where his home is?” (RL.6). Students use text evidence</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>collected within the lesson to respond in their response journal. In Module 4: Artists Make Art, Lesson 21, students answer a multiple choice question concerning the author's organization of the biography text. This question reads, "How do the authors organize the information in the text?" Once answering the question, students must then find two pieces of evidence within the text to support their answer in paragraph form (RI.3.3, RI.3.1). Overall, students follow the provided sequential steps within lessons. The materials provide guiding questions and culminating lesson questions that support the module Focus Question. Students use standard language as they progress through lessons and use this same language within their responses.</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 3. COHERENCE OF TASKS: Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> | <p>Required 3a) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Module lessons follow five content stages which build knowledge to answer the overall module Focus Question. Materials include the following stages as students engage with module texts: Wonder, Organize, Reveal, and Distill. These five stages offer a coherent sequence of tasks geared toward the module central topic. For example, in Module 2: Outer Space, Lesson 3, students read <i>Starry Messenger</i>, by Peter Sis. Students enter the Wonder stage and utilize</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | | | <p>the process of examination to make connections between elements such as illustrations, text features, or title and the Essential Question of the module, How do people learn about space? Students begin to process what space knowledge can be built using this text. In Module 2: Outer Space, Lesson 4-5, students reread <i>Starry Messenger</i> to analyze the organization of the text. Students focus on the sequence of events within Galileo’s life to make a timeline of key events in the history of space and the invention of the telescope. Students use this timeline to answer text dependent questions such as “How does the information on pages [3-7] about events before the birth of Galileo add to your understanding of Galileo’s life?” Students also analyze the cause and effect relationships within the text to better understand information portrayed. Students answer text dependent questions verbally such as, “On page [3], what caused people to believe that “the earth was the center of the universe”? In Module 2: Outer Space, Lesson 6-7, students engage in a deeper exploration of figurative language and text features to determine what they reveal about the text. These skills are to demonstrate student knowledge in the overall main idea of a text. Students then distill the text in Lesson 9 by answering, “What caused people to change their beliefs about the earth and the sun? Use evidence from the text to support your answer.” This</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>stage takes students away from a broad, all-encompassing view to a reduced, important message. Students gather evidence for the writing prompt “Explain how Galileo’s actions caused important effects.”</p> <p>Ultimately, these tasks build upon one another to deliver the impact of Galileo on people’s beliefs, as well as in the scientific community. Students will then use this information later to address the Essential Question, How do people learn about space? In Module 4: Artists Make Art, students use a variety of text types such as picture books, paintings, poems, articles, transcripts, photographs, and videos to build knowledge across the module. In Lesson 20, students focus on the Essential Question, “What is an artist?” The core text <i>Action Jackson</i>, by Jan Greenburg and Sandra Jordan is utilized to build background knowledge of the artist Jackson Pollock. Students are guided through the five content stages to observe and analyze the importance of author’s word choice, gathering evidence for research, and essential meaning. Each of these content stages leads to a comparison of two core texts in Lesson 29. Students answer the following question, “How do <i>Action Jackson</i> and <i>When Marian Sang</i> build my knowledge of character traits?” This Focus Question task in Lesson 29 supports student success in the End-of-Module Essential Question task by building understanding of two artists on which to focus, research simulation, as</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>well as using technology to interact and collaborate. Overall, students consistently engage in content stages that are coherently sequenced to promote understanding of the text, make connections among the texts, and express understanding of ideas presented.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3b) Questions and tasks are designed so that students build, apply, and integrate knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. For example, in Module 1: The Sea, students build knowledge through guided and repeated reading of core texts to provide a learning pathway toward answering the Essential Question, Why do people explore the sea? Students engage in a variety of verbal discussion models such as Socratic Seminars, think-pair-shares, and jigsaws, as well as written activities throughout the module. In Lesson 10, students read <i>Ocean Sunlight: How Tiny Plants Feed the Seas</i>, by Molly Bang and Penny Chisholm, to build knowledge in informational text which is beneficial for the End-of-Module Task Expository Writing Task, as well as to examine word meanings and relationships. Students answer questions, through a think-pair-share discussion protocol, such as: “What evidence helps you understand whether this book is fiction or nonfiction?” and “Reread the text on page 16. What gives phytoplankton life? How do you think phytoplankton grow?” Students discuss with partners and share with the</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>group which prompts speaking and listening expectations (agreeing and disagreeing). Later, in Lesson 12, students utilize accumulated evidence from their knowledge journal, along with their New Words organizer to formulate a written summary collaboratively addressing the question, “What is the essential meaning of <i>Ocean Sunlight: How Tiny Plants Feed the Seas?</i>” This expression of textual knowledge is then used later to assist in the expository End-of-Module Task. Module 3: A New Home addresses the Essential Question, How do stories help us understand immigrants’ experiences? Students begin with an oral reading of <i>Grandfather’s Journey</i>, by Allen Say, to explore elements of fiction which are beneficial to the End-of-Module Narrative Writing Task. In Lesson 2, students begin to decipher between various shades of meaning for words such as: trip, traveled, voyage, and journey. Students discuss vocabulary with partners to then answer text dependent questions verbally. In Lesson 3, knowledge is built further with character thoughts, feelings and actions. Students are asked to identify text evidence to an assigned written prompt which is answered with a partner. Questions include: “How do grandfather’s feelings about home and moving affect the events of the story?” and “What makes it hard for grandfather to get what he wants?” Students identify evidence with expert groups to prepare for partner discussion. After building knowledge</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>through narrative story elements and character emotions in previous lessons, students venture into answering the following character point of view written response independently: “Based on the text, what is the narrator’s point of view about where his home is?” The materials provide students with ample practice to ensure success on the culminating End-of-Module Narrative Writing. Overall, module lesson progression allows for students to build, apply, and, eventually, integrate knowledge to demonstrate reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language skills. The materials use a gradual release model among core texts so that students can explore necessary skills to be successful during the integration phase.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3c) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically related words, word families, etc.) rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. In each of the modules, students engage in vocabulary and language use Deep Dives. These opportunities conclude each lesson within the module and meet a range of language standards. For example, in Module 1: The Sea, Lesson 5, students read page ten of <i>Amos and Boris</i> to</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>examine the meaning and function of adverbs. Students answer the following question verbally with a partner: “What word in the sentence describes how Amos grabbed for the boat?” Students review adverbs and locate all adverbs within <i>Amos and Boris</i>. Students then determine the root word and use dictionaries to define the root words to present findings to peers. In Lesson 26, students examine choosing words and phrases for effect by discussing words and their meanings independent from the text <i>Giant Squid: Searching for a Sea Monster</i>. Students then exhibit understanding of enhanced meaning when in text excerpts. Students answer the following question independently in their response journals: “What do the word choices in these sentences suggest about the author’s feelings about squid?” In Module 2: Outer Space, Lesson 13, after examining <i>Moonshot</i>, by Brian Floca, students explore academic vocabulary, release and reduce, through direct quotations from the text. Students create a Graffiti Wall with groups explaining why these verbs might be essential in understanding Apollo 11’s engineering and flight. Students then work in pairs utilizing dictionaries to define the multiple meanings of each word. These tasks ultimately lead to students writing independently to answer the following question: “Why are these two words so important to Apollo 11’s design?” In Lesson 28, literal and nonliteral language is</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | distinguished through the use of the core text <i>Zathura</i> . Students review definitions for academic vocabulary such as: nonliteral language, simile, and metaphor. Page 6 of <i>Zathura</i> is orally read aloud with the focus placed on the phrase little fungus. Students define fungus as the literal translation and work to determine the nonliteral meaning through the use of text dependent questions. Students answer the questions verbally with a partner. This partner work aims to yield an answer to the following question independently: “How does Walter’s use of nonliteral language help you understand the relationship between the brothers?” Throughout materials, students are consistently examining language and building knowledge on the use of that language within a genre. Language skills are assessed at the end of each module lesson with short written, or verbal prompts. |
| Section II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Indicators (Grades K-5 only) | | | |
| Non-negotiable* 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4a) Materials provide and follow a logical sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards (based on the Vertical Progression of Foundational Skills) while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only Indicator 4b) Materials provide grade-appropriate instruction and practice for the concepts of print (e.g., following words left to right, | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>top to bottom, page by page; words are followed by spaces; and features of a sentence).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only 4c) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonological awareness instruction (e.g., recognizing rhyming words; clapping syllables; blending onset-rime; and blending, segmenting, deleting, and substituting phonemes).</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4d) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonics instruction. Instruction progresses from simple to more complex sound–spelling patterns and word analysis skills that includes repeated modeling and opportunities for students to hear, say, write, and read sound and spelling patterns (e.g. sounds, words, sentences, reading within text).</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only Indicator 4e) Materials provide multiple opportunities and practice for students to master grade appropriate high-frequency words using multisensory techniques.</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4f) Resources and/or texts provide ample practice of foundational reading skills using texts (e.g. decodable readers) and allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of reading foundational skills, including phonics patterns and word analysis skills in decoding words.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback.</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4g) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and/or informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4h) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. (<i>Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.</i>) • In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns. | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4i) Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring includes attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4j) Foundational Skills materials are abundant and easily implemented so that teachers can spend time, attention and practice with students who need foundational skills supports. | N/A | |
| Section III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality | | | |
| 5. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | Required 5a) Materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The majority of informational texts have an informational text structure. • In grades 3-12, narrative structure (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays) of informational text are also included. | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | Required 5b) Materials include print and/or non-print texts in a variety of formats (e.g. a range of film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories, poetry, and novels). | | |
| | 5c) Additional materials provide direction and practice for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and develop knowledge of classroom concepts or topics. | | |
| 6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE: | Required 6a) Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.⁶</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 6b) The majority of oral and written tasks require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 6c) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s). • In grades 3-12, tasks may include blended modes (e.g., analytical writing). | | |
| | <p>Required 6d) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own | | |

⁶ Technology and digital media may be used, when appropriate, to support the standards addressed in this indicator.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | sentence construction as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage. | | |
| <p>7. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 7a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7b) Materials assess student understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the unit texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students demonstrate the knowledge and skill built over the course of the unit.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7d) Measurement of progress via assessments include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p> | | |
| <p>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 8a) As needed, pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself (i.e. providing background knowledge, supporting vocabulary acquisition). Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of skills or strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | on building knowledge and insight. Texts do not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies. | | |
| | Required 8c) Materials include guidance and support that regularly directs teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading and discussion about the ideas, events, and information found there. | | |
| | Required 8d) Materials provide additional supports for expressing understanding through formal discussion and writing development (i.e. sentence frames, paragraph frames, modeled writing, student exemplars). | | |
| | Required 8e) Materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. Teacher editions are concise and easy to manage with clear connections between teacher resources. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus. | | |
| | Required 8f) Support for English Learners and diverse learners is provided. Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level. The language in which questions and problems are posed is not an obstacle to understanding the content, and if it is, additional supports are included (e.g., alternative teacher approaches, pacing and instructional delivery options, strategies or suggestions for supporting access to text and/or content, suggestions for modifications, suggestions for vocabulary acquisition, etc.). | | |
| | 8g) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. Materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take. | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria. | | | |
| Compile the results for Sections I-III to make a final decision for the material under review. | | | |
| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
| I. K-12 Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality⁷ | 1. Quality of Texts | Yes | Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. |
| | 2. Text-Dependent Questions | Yes | A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity |

⁷ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. |
| | 3. Coherence of Tasks | Yes | Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. |
| II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Criteria (grades K-5 only)⁸ | 4. Foundational Skills | N/A | |
| III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality⁹ | 5. Range and Volume of Texts | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | | See EdReports for more information. |

⁸ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

⁹ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier 1 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| | 7. Assessments | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 8. Scaffolding and Support | | See EdReports for more information. |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier 1, Exemplifies quality | | | |

*As applicable



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **4**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-3-8>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**⁴ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II⁵ and all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-4 to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet **Non-Negotiable** Criteria 1-3 for the review to continue to Section III.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section III: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

⁴ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “Required” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

⁵ For grades K-5: Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2-3. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|---|
| <p>SECTION I. K-12 NON-NEGOTIABLE CRITERIA OF SUPERIOR QUALITY Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II and all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet all of the Non-Negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section III.</p> | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable 1. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 1a) Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A text analysis that includes complexity information is provided. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis, as well as reader and task considerations. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. • In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Anchor texts placed within the four, Grade 4 modules include a range of eight literary, five informational, and three poetry reading opportunities centered around a single theme, or topic per module. The majority of texts fall between 640-1120 Lexile, as identified by quantitative measures. Five of the core texts extend past the Grade 4 740-1010 Lexile band and one of the sixteen falls below. Three texts are categorized as poetry and do not offer quantitative measures. The five above-level texts are utilized within guided, repeated reading settings. Analysis of the text and necessary skills is not conducted until thorough modeling has occurred. Texts extending past the grade-level threshold offer knowledge that builds throughout the module and is accessible to students with teacher support. Therefore, texts that students are responsible for independently reading are complex in meaning and language, yet age-appropriate. In Module 1, students read the informational scientific text <i>The Circulatory Story</i>, by Mary K. Corcoran. Qualitative analysis deems the text as very complex.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>This rating is due to the heavy use of scientific terms and concepts, as well as figurative language explanations. Students may find this text challenging based on vocabulary and limited background knowledge; however, detailed illustrations such as diagrams and figurative cartoons illustrate and add to the information in the text making it more accessible to students. This text has a Lexile measurement of 850 which is well within the 4-5 grade band. This text is utilized as a guided repeated reading and includes the following: teacher read-aloud, illustration, and figurative language exploration, as well as evidence collection. During this module, students are also exposed to the core text, <i>Love That Dog</i>, by Sharon Creech. This text has a Lexile level of 1010, which is within the grade band, but at its peak. This text is deemed moderately complex as students may have difficulty with the overall journal-like text structure which is an opportunity to compare and contrast poetry and prose. There is poetic language throughout and has multiple layers of meaning which could also pose a challenge. Students receive guided instruction throughout the use of this text to ensure understanding. In Module 2, students read the literary novel <i>Hatchet</i>, by Gary Paulsen. This text, which is leveled at a 1020 Lexile, slightly exceeds the Grade 4 quantitative range. Qualitative analysis deems this to be moderately complex. The chronological structure of the text is clear,</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>straightforward, and easy to follow. Word choice and sentence structure are simple and reflect casual speech patterns of the main character, a young boy. Yet, literary flashbacks, certain changes in sentence structure, and themes that may require more in-depth analysis could prove difficult for struggling readers. Teacher support is provided throughout with repeated, focused readings. In Module 4, students read the informational, historical account, <i>Understanding Greek Myths</i>, by Natalie Hyde. This core text is listed as a 970 Lexile which is on the higher end of the Grade 4 range. Qualitative analysis deems this text as moderately complex. The informational nature of this text offers an organized flow of ideas that build upon one another, it provides a series of photographs, maps, and art to accompany text as well as define ideas further. This text is dense with mostly complex, domain-specific language and sentence structure. Students may have challenges when understanding aspects of culture. This text is combed through repeatedly within the module to allow students to fully grasp the concepts. Overall, anchor and supporting texts are appropriately complex. Modules within the Grade 4 unit provide ample practice with on-level and above-level texts. The reading opportunities promote challenging knowledge and language demands while remaining accessible to students with the assistance of the teacher. Teachers guide</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | students through a wide range of activities to analyze texts and gain full comprehension of their purpose to demonstrate mastery in the End-of-Module Tasks. |
| | <p>Required Indicator 1b) At least 90% of provided texts, including read-alouds in K-2, are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p> | Yes | <p>At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Literary and informational texts following module themes are presented throughout the year. Eleven of the sixteen core texts offered are critically acclaimed pieces of writing, or have been written by award-winning authors. Texts combine essential literary criteria to achieve student standards and discipline specific content knowledge from published authors which promote engaging learning opportunities for students. In Module 1: A Great Heart, Lessons 19-29, students explore the figurative meaning of heart in <i>Love that Dog</i>, by award winning author Sharon Creech. During this reading, students gather, from a young protagonist, how word choice and poetry study can evoke powerful emotions to affect the reader. Sharon Creech is also highlighted later in module four for her Newbery Medal award winning book, <i>Walk Two Moons</i>. In Module 2: Extreme Settings, students read a variety of critically acclaimed texts such as the Newbery Honor-winning young-adult wilderness survival novel <i>Hatchet</i>, by Gary</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Paulsen, the short story <i>All in a Summer Day</i>, by National Book Foundation Medal and Pulitzer Prize special citation author, Ray Bradbury, as well as two poems by the Pulitzer Prize winning author, Robert Frost. Students build knowledge on the aspects of environments to understand human responses to challenges presented in nature. In Module 3: <i>The Redcoats are Coming</i>, Lessons 1-4, students read the Orbis Pictus award winner <i>George vs. George: The American Revolution as Seen from Both Sides</i>, by Rosalyn Schanzer to investigate events leading up to the American Revolution. Students revisit this text throughout the module to research and build knowledge in comparison to other informational texts. In Module 4: <i>Myth Making</i>, Lessons 8-13, students focus on a literary drama to build knowledge of myths from various cultures. This drama titled, <i>Pushing Up the Sky: Seven Native American Plays for Children</i>, is written by acclaimed Native American storyteller, Joseph Bruchac. Students enter a comparative study to discover similarities amongst Greek and Native American cultures when viewing themes and purpose. Overall, each of the modules offers students the opportunity to build knowledge of content related to the overarching module theme. Students engage with quality, critically acclaimed literary and informational works that promote mastery when paired with standards based learning activities.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | <p>Required</p> <p>1c) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex texts. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Each of the four, Grade 4 modules provides various learning opportunities that build through the use of lesson arcs. Within these arcs, learning is centered around Focus Questions which pave a learning path toward answering the overall Essential Question during the End-of-Module Task. Students are supported appropriately depending on the complexity of the texts. For example, in Module 3: The Redcoats are coming! students venture through four lesson arcs centered around Focus Questions. Each Focus Question builds and prepares students for the End-of-Module Task centered around the Essential Question: Why is it important to understand all sides of a story?" In Arc 1, Focus Question 1, Lessons 1-8, the Focus Question, What were the perspectives of the two main sides of the American Revolution? is at the forefront of learning. Students begin by reading the text introduction of <i>George vs. George: The American Revolution as Seen from Both Sides</i> in pairs to observe (notice/wonder) and provide context when comparing the Essential Question and Focus Question. Students then listen and fluently read the first section of the book adding to their written observations. They then discuss findings with one another through</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>accountable talk. Students begin to build knowledge of differing perspectives within the war, learn evidence collection and also define key terms such as revolution. Toward the end of this arc, students embark on comparatively analyzing the texts of <i>George vs. George: The American Revolution as Seen from Both Sides</i> and <i>Massacre in King Street</i> with the propaganda art “The Boston Massacre.” Through open, whole group discussion, students begin to determine central messages of the artwork and texts to identify bias of opposing perspectives. Finally, students then utilize their evidence collection, central message, and bias identification skills to explain the two main sides justly. This is accomplished through a written essay. In Arc 2, Focus Question 2, Lessons 9-15, students are guided by the following Focus Question: How did different people’s experiences affect their perspectives on the American Revolution? Students listen to the complex text <i>Colonial Voices: Hear Them Speak</i>, by Kay Winters. Students engage in an exploration of key details to generate overall meaning, or the main ideas. Students repeatedly read the first and second half of the text, independently and with partners, to gather essential information toward colonial experiences. Students then participate in small-group discussion with assigned text dependent questions to organize written thoughts. Finally, students utilize their main idea findings from the text to state their</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>opinion of the Boston Tea Party through the lens of a specified colonial American. This is accomplished through an opinion letter and evidence of the job and familial experiences of the individual. In Arc 3, Focus Question 3, Lessons 16-20, students build upon the previous Focus Question by layering perspectives with actions. Students focus on the question, “How did different people’s perspectives affect their actions during the American Revolution?” Within this arc, students follow a similar pattern of observation and organizational analysis. Students are able to sequence events and compare the historical accuracy through research of the previous text George vs George and the image “Washington Crossing the Delaware.” Students steadily practice reading fluently with partners and gathering evidence of character actions to understand perspective. At the end of this arc, students utilize their character action findings to express the connection between perspective and action in the American Revolution. This is accomplished through an explanatory writing task utilizing skills observed through informational module texts and language practice. However, during the focus task within this arc, there is an emphasis on revision through peer feedback specifically technologically. In Arc 4, Focus Question 4, Lessons 21-33, students build knowledge toward the Essential Question by answering the following Focus Question: What drove the Patriots to fight their independence</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>from Britain? In Lesson 22, students examine different perspectives through the text <i>Woods Runner</i>, by Gary Paulsen. Students read the text to identify key details in the first three chapters. In Lesson 23, students use their knowledge of key details to compare and contrast messages across various core texts within the modules. Students discuss in small group and whole group settings. Toward the end of the arc, students are tasked with writing an opinion essay in regard to the Focus Question. Students must determine “Who best demonstrates American spirit in <i>Woods Runner</i>? Support your response with evidence from <i>Woods Runner</i>.” Overall, through the use of lesson arcs, Focus Questions build upon each other to prompt content knowledge. These focused writings prepare students for the End-of-Module Tasks. Reading, writing, speaking and language are present throughout arcs and lessons in a manner in which all students can access learning. Lesson arcs follow similar learning structures throughout the modules providing students with confidence in their abilities as texts and concepts become more complex.</p> |
| | <p>Required 1d) Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. For example, in Module 2, Extreme Settings: Students engage in multiple readings of the text <i>All Summer in a Day</i>. In Lesson 1, students partake in a read</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>aloud of the text with the primary focus residing in observations as note-taking is modeled. Students create questions in response to the read-aloud. In Lesson 2, students review the questions from the previous lesson and create new questions to direct the second, small group read through. Students work with peers to fill in a story map for the text. Students also read the core text <i>Mountains</i> during this module. Students are prompted to reread the text to identify key descriptions of mountain ranges. For example in Lesson 12, teacher guidance states, “Working in small groups, students reread pages 1-7 and identify key descriptions by recording them in their handout.” Students then use their findings to verbally answer the question, “Based on these descriptions, how do scientists describe and compare mountains?” Later in Lesson 13, students reread <i>Mountains</i> with the primary focus of identifying main ideas and supporting details. Students utilize the “boxes and bullets” graphic organizer, which was previously used in module one, to record these ideas. In Module 4: Myth Making, students read to learn about various Greek myths and their themes. One such text is <i>Understanding Greek Myths</i>. In Lesson 4, students search for direct evidence in small groups to uncover the mystery that the myth explains. Students answer guiding questions and share out, utilizing accountable talk. In Lesson 5, students engage with two core texts: <i>Gifts from the</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>Gods: Ancient Words and Wisdom from Greek and Roman Mythology</i> and <i>Understanding Greek Myths</i>. Students break into a small group jigsaw activity to analyze assigned Greek myth excerpts. Students complete the poster evidence to then rehearse and present their visual. During this module, students also engage in multiple readings of <i>Walk Two Moons</i>. In Lesson 23, students listen as the teacher reads Chapter 23. Students create one discussion question for an upcoming peer think-pair-share. In Lesson 24, students reread Chapter 23 as a whole group. While reading, students annotate any unfamiliar words. The teacher prompts students during the reading to add vocabulary to their chart to be defined. Students engage in text dependent questions following the text. Overall, students revisit texts throughout each module during lesson arcs, as well as during the End-of-Module Task. Students utilize texts for basic comprehension, necessary content knowledge accumulation, purposeful evidence gathering, and expressing understanding through verbal or written expression. Each module has a clear complex text progression using a gradual release model. Students are able to listen to a fluent reader, practice fluent reading with small groups, and reread for evidence collection.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--|
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met)</p> <p>2. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> <p>Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>2a) A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Lessons are structured in the same manner within each module: Welcome, Launch, Learn, Land, and Wrap. Students are provided text dependent questions (TDQs) steadily over the course of the four modules, especially within the learn segments of each lesson. Students answer TDQs after the focused whole group read aloud and/or small group rereading verbally. Students are also tasked with answering written responses during land segments to express lesson understanding. For example, in Module 1: A Great Heart, Lesson 14, students read <i>The Circulatory Story</i> and respond to questions such as: “According to the text, what happens during cellular respiration, and why is this process important?” and “How do the illustrations on pages 20 and 21 help the reader understand the ideas in this passage?” Later in the module, students read <i>Love That Dog</i>. In Lesson 28, students answer TDQs within a think-pair-share discussion framework. These questions include: “How does Jack feel about Walter Dean Myers and his visit? How do you know? Support your ideas with evidence from pages 80 through 86.” and “Based on the text, what do you think Walter Myers is like?” In Module 2: Extreme Settings, Lesson 8, students read the poem “Dust of Snow,” by Robert Frost to analyze how character traits and themes are</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>inferred in poetry. Students provide verbal responses to the following prompts “What is a different response a person might have if he had snow knocked onto him? What type of person is the speaker in the poem based on his reaction to being dusted by the snow?” and “How did the speaker’s perspective change and how did the setting impact his perspective?” Later, students used the knowledge built to complete a quick write to answer the content framing question “What does a deeper exploration of word choice reveal in the poem “Dust of Snow?” Over the entirety of the module, students answer the module Essential Question, How does a challenging setting or physical environment change a person? by working toward the End-of-Module task. This task asks students to write a narrative survival story, mirroring craft and structure of core texts, ensuring character emotions and responses to challenges are present. In Module 3: The Redcoats are Coming! Lesson 13, students reread the new read assessment article <i>Detested Tea</i>, by Andrew Matthews to analyze how firsthand accounts of an event are more likely to contain opinions than secondhand accounts. Students do this by verbally responding to the following TDQ: “What are the different opinions about the Boston Tea Party? What reasons are given to support each opinion?” and “How does this text impact your understanding of the Loyalists and/or Patriots perspectives on the American</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Revolution?” In Lesson 18, students research historical accuracy and perspective by utilizing their knowledge from the following two sources: <i>The Scarlet Stockings Spy</i>, by Trinka Hakes Noble, and <i>George vs. George: The American Revolution as Seen from Both Sides</i>, by Rosalyn Schanzer. Students answer the content framing question in their response journals: “What does a deeper exploration of Maddy Rose’s actions reveal about her perspective on the American Revolution? What other character or historical figure let their perspective affect their actions?” Overall, text dependent questions are prescribed daily whether verbally, or within written responses. Students have a variety of verbal response opportunities such as whole group, small groups, or in partner discussion settings. Students consistently build knowledge within their response journals by expressing their understanding. These response journals are reviewed by the teacher daily and utilized by the student for the end of module writing. Text dependent questions are aligned with module focus throughout.</p> |
| | <p>Required 2b) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. (Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. For example, in Module 2: Extreme Settings, Lesson 5, students determine how the setting of the story affected the characters, as well as a theme</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>that can be supported by evidence within the text. These skills are assessed during a Socratic Seminar using the text, <i>All in a Summer Day</i>. Students answer the question: “How does the setting affect the characters in <i>All in a Summer Day</i>?” What is the theme of the story?” (RL.2, RL.3). Students use evidence collected during the snowball toss activity to assist in preparing their written thoughts before speaking. In Module 3: The Redcoats are Coming! Lesson 16, students begin their initial read of <i>The Scarlet Stockings Spy</i> to compare it to the previous text <i>Colonial Voices</i>. Students focus on the narrator point of view when answering the following question: “What do you notice about the voice of the narrator in this story? Is this a first person point of view story like <i>Colonial Voices</i>?” (RL.6). Students then use their understanding of point of view in the following lessons to help build an understanding of firsthand and secondhand account bias in historical accuracy and how experience and perspective play a role in the account. In Module 4: Myth Making, Lesson 16, students answer questions based on the text <i>Walk Two Moons</i>. Using the story map evidence completed in the first reading, students answer questions when rereading such as: “Why is Sal telling her grandparents Phoebe’s story? What does this have to do with Sal’s own story? Quote from the text to support your answer.” (RL.4.1) In Lesson 17, students further focus on evidence based response by answering the question, “Who</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>is described as having a vivid imagination? How does the author use vivid descriptions throughout this story? Cite from the text in your response.” Students must find at least two pieces of evidence within the text to support their answer in paragraph form (RL3.3, RL4.1). Overall, the materials provide students with questions that promote deep, meaningful understanding of not only the text, but of the English language skills necessary to demonstrate mastery in culminating tasks. Questions support the module focus while also using standard language.</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 3. COHERENCE OF TASKS: Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 3a) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Module lessons follow five content stages which build knowledge to answer the overall module Focus Question. Materials include the following stages as students engage with module texts: Wonder, Organize, Reveal, and Distill. These five stages offer a coherent sequence of tasks geared toward the module central topic. For example, in Module 1: A Great Heart, Lesson 7, students read <i>The Circulatory Story</i>, by Mary K. Corcoran. Students enter the Wonder stage and utilize observation of illustrations and text features to make connections within their understanding of the overall text and its organization. Students begin to define</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>key vocabulary and identify listening goals to improve comprehension. In Lesson 8, students reread <i>The Circulatory Story</i>, with a specific emphasis on pages 6-7, to analyze the organization of the text. Students focus on the main ideas and supporting details of red blood cells within the body to promote note-taking using graphic organizers. In Lessons 9-14, students cycle through the stages of Organize and Reveal. Students engage in a deeper exploration of figurative language and text features within large sections of the text to determine their impact on overall comprehension of circulatory system functions. Students practice skills such as paraphrasing and summarization to discuss the author's word choice. Students gradually analyze a large portion of the text through this cycle to distill the text in Lesson 16. Students use the evidence gathered over the course of the past lessons to answer the content-framing question "What is the essential meaning of <i>The Circulatory Story</i>?" Students participate in a Socratic Seminar to discuss responses. Ultimately, this discussion amongst peers allows for students to solidify their thinking prior to answering the written Focus Question, What is a great heart, literally? In Module 4: Myth Making, Lessons 15-22, students focus on the Essential Question, What can we learn from myths and stories? The core text <i>Walk Two Moons</i>, by Sharon Creech, is utilized to build knowledge of narrative elements through its various</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>stories with overarching themes and messages. Students are guided through the five content stages to observe and analyze sequencing, importance of word choice for effect and meaning, evidence of author's craft, as well as essential themes. Each of these content stages leads to a comparison of core texts in Lesson 24. Students encounter references of Greek and Native American myths. Students determine how the themes of these myths impact the main character. In their response journals, students answer questions, such as “How do the themes of Pandora’s box connect to the story themes?” “How does Phoebe's story differ from the one you’ve read, and from Ben’s report?” and “What important realizations does Sal have while thinking about the myths?” These questions guide students toward answering the Focus Question, What does Sal learn in Walk Two Moons? in Lesson 28. These learning opportunities across the module support student success in the End-of-Module Task Essential Question task by building understanding of story elements, as well as the impacts of myths on human understanding and choices. All of this evidence collected can be used in the written response. Overall, students consistently engage in content stages that are coherently sequenced to promote understanding and build the skills necessary to express thoughtful text analysis through spoken and written responses.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | <p>Required 3b) Questions and tasks are designed so that students build, apply, and integrate knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. For example, in Module 2: Extreme Settings, students engage in a variety of learning activities which lead to answering the overarching Essential Question, How does a challenging setting or physical environment change a person? In Lesson 9, students work in pairs to annotate and analyze the poem “Stopping by the Woods on a Snowy Evening.” Students rotate around the room to answer questions, such as: “What is happening in the poem?” “What do the speaker’s thoughts reveal about the setting of the poem?” and “What is the theme of the poem?” This offers students an opening into narrative elements and how they can be featured in a wide range of writing styles. In Lesson 21, students continue reading the narrative <i>Hatchet</i>, by Gary Paulsen to build knowledge of wilderness terrain, evolution of survival methods, and narrative elements which is beneficial for the End-of-Module Narrative Writing Task. Students create an evidence guide to examine Brian’s thoughts and actions in responding to challenges in an extreme setting. Students answer text-dependent questions after reading chapters six and seven through a think-pair-share and whole-group discussion protocol. Questions include: “Why are the flashbacks to Terry and the TV show important to the story?”</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>“How is Brian different in this chapter?” and “What does Brian learn from the encounter with the bear?” Students discuss with partners and share with the group which prompts speaking and listening expectations of agreeing and disagreeing. In Lesson 22, students utilize accumulated evidence from their knowledge journal, along with their mountain charts to formulate a written narrative draft addressing the Essential Question. Students continue to gain knowledge of survival over the course of the remaining lessons. Students collaboratively discuss ways to incorporate sensory details, figurative language, and character development. Through analysis, students work to revise and edit with spoken and written feedback from peers and teachers.</p> <p>Module 3: The Redcoats are Coming! addresses the Essential Question, Why is it important to understand all sides of a story? Students begin with an oral reading of <i>George vs. George: The American Revolution as Seen from Both Sides</i>, by Rosalyn Schanzer, to explore and summarize differing perspectives of the colonists and how these differences can lead to conflict. In Lesson 4, students begin to compare and contrast various perspectives surrounding a similar event. Students discuss similar vocabulary when describing the Boston Massacre in two texts verbally with partners. Students then answer text dependent questions during whole group instruction to gather evidence. In Lesson 6,</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>knowledge is built further about the event in question with perspectives from artwork and film. Students compare and contrast visuals and texts to answer the following written questions: “From what we’ve learned about the Boston Massacre, what aspects of this image seem accurate or true?” “Which parts of the image do not align with what we have read?” and “How is Revere’s artwork similar to and different from the illustration on page 22 in <i>George vs. George?</i>” Students review evidence accumulated from artwork, film, and texts to then participate in a role-play discussion. Students select a conflict to discuss as an individual from each perspective. As an exit ticket of the lesson, students answer the following question in their response journals: “Which of the three accounts of the Boston Massacre is not like the others? How is this difference related to perspective?” The materials provide ample modeling throughout the module. Students draft sections of their end of module writing as learning and evidence evolve over each lesson. Overall, module lesson progression allows for students to build, apply and eventually integrate knowledge to demonstrate reading, writing, speaking, listening and language skills. Gradual release of skills is offered during individual lessons, as well as across lesson arcs to ensure success when interacting with complex texts.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | <p>Required</p> <p>3c) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically related words, word families, etc.) rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. Throughout each module, students engage in vocabulary and language use Deep Dives. These craft lessons cycle through stages that mirror a gradual release. Stages include: Examine, Experiment, and Execute. These opportunities conclude each lesson within the module and meet a range of language standards. For example, in Module 1: A Great Heart, Lesson 13, students read an excerpt from page 11 of <i>The Circulatory Story</i> to examine the purpose and function of commas in compound sentences. Students define the parameters of a compound sentence through the example. Students then observe various other excerpts from the text to address the rule when punctuating a compound sentence. Students answer the following questions verbally with a partner: “What would happen if a writer took three or four sentences and combined them into one?” and “How does a comma help a reader comprehend a compound sentence?” In Lesson 14, students review previous learning to experiment with commas in</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>compound sentences. In groups, students assemble sentences from <i>The Circulatory Story</i> into compound sentences. Once sentences have been assembled, they are chorally read aloud. Students answer the following question in pairs: “Look at the first and third strips in the lineup. Do they make sense if read alone?” Students then practice combining sentences from the text with partners. Finally, in Lesson 15, students execute their learning by creating compound sentences using sentence frames. These sentence frames have students exhibit understanding of main ideas within the text. In Module 4: Myth Making, Lesson 9, after examining <i>Pushing Up the Sky</i>, by Joseph Bruchac, students observe modal auxiliary verbs through direct quotations from the text. During the learning process students answer questions such as: “What part of speech are the italicized words? What else do the italicized words have in common?” and “What are some of the functions of the italicized words?” Students verbally answer questions with partners. Students practice using modal auxiliary verbs in conversation using sentence stems. Students then view a conversation within the drama to answer the following question: “Which modal auxiliary verb is used in this conversation? Why does the writer use a modal auxiliary verb instead of a regular verb? Why is it important?” In Lesson 10, students move past the initial definition of modal auxiliary</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>verbs and prioritize their focus on how the verbs work when used in a variety of contexts. Using excerpts from the texts <i>Understanding Greek Myths</i> and <i>Gifts from the Gods</i>, students answer questions with partners and independently such as: “How does the modal auxiliary verb used change the meaning of each of these three sentences?” and “Which sentence are you more likely to use in conversation? Which sentence are you more likely to use in writing?” Students then write a short letter to a character within the text as an advisor. Students must use modal auxiliary verbs and adjectives used to describe the character earlier in the lesson within their writing. Throughout the materials, students consistently have opportunities to examine, experiment, and execute language skills. Students build knowledge on the use of that language within a genre for mastery in later tasks. Language skills are assessed in verbal and written prompts throughout the modules whether in individual lessons or Focus Questions.</p> |
| Section II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Indicators (Grades K-5 only) | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable* 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency</p> | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4a) Materials provide and follow a logical sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards (based on the Vertical Progression of Foundational Skills) while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p> | <p>N/A</p> | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only Indicator 4b) Materials provide grade-appropriate instruction and practice for the concepts of print (e.g., following words left to right, top to bottom, page by page; words are followed by spaces; and features of a sentence).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only 4c) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonological awareness instruction (e.g., recognizing rhyming words; clapping syllables; blending onset-rime; and blending, segmenting, deleting, and substituting phonemes).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4d) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonics instruction. Instruction progresses from simple to more complex sound–spelling patterns and word analysis skills that includes repeated modeling and opportunities for students to hear, say, write, and read sound and spelling patterns (e.g. sounds, words, sentences, reading within text).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only Indicator 4e) Materials provide multiple opportunities and practice for students to master grade appropriate high-frequency words using multisensory techniques.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4f) Resources and/or texts provide ample practice of foundational reading skills using texts (e.g. decodable readers) and allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of reading foundational skills, including phonics patterns and word analysis skills in decoding words.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4g) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and/or informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4h) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. (<i>Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.</i>) • In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns. | | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4i) Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring includes attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4j) Foundational Skills materials are abundant and easily implemented so that teachers can spend time, attention and practice with students who need foundational skills supports. | N/A | |
| Section III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality | | | |
| 5. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | Required 5a) Materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The majority of informational texts have an informational text structure. • In grades 3-12, narrative structure (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays) of informational text are also included. | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | Required 5b) Materials include print and/or non-print texts in a variety of formats (e.g. a range of film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories, poetry, and novels). | | |
| | 5c) Additional materials provide direction and practice for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and develop knowledge of classroom concepts or topics. | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE: The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 6a) Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.⁶</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 6b) The majority of oral and written tasks require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 6c) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s). In grades 3-12, tasks may include blended modes (e.g., analytical writing). | | |
| | <p>Required 6d) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts.</p> | | |

⁶ Technology and digital media may be used, when appropriate, to support the standards addressed in this indicator.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own sentence construction as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage. | | |
| <p>7. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 7a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7b) Materials assess student understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the unit texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students demonstrate the knowledge and skill built over the course of the unit.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7d) Measurement of progress via assessments include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p> | | |
| <p>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend</p> | <p>Required 8a) As needed, pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself (i.e. providing background knowledge, supporting vocabulary acquisition). Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 8b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of skills or strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts do not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8c) Materials include guidance and support that regularly directs teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading and discussion about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8d) Materials provide additional supports for expressing understanding through formal discussion and writing development (i.e. sentence frames, paragraph frames, modeled writing, student exemplars).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8e) Materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. Teacher editions are concise and easy to manage with clear connections between teacher resources. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8f) Support for English Learners and diverse learners is provided. Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level. The language in which questions and problems are posed is not an obstacle to understanding the content, and if it is, additional supports are included (e.g., alternative teacher approaches, pacing and instructional delivery options, strategies or suggestions for supporting access to text and/or content, suggestions for modifications, suggestions for vocabulary acquisition, etc.).</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | 8g) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. Materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take. | | |
| FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria. | | | |
| Compile the results for Sections I-III to make a final decision for the material under review. | | | |
| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
| I. K-12 Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality⁷ | 1. Quality of Texts | Yes | Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. |
| | 2. Text-Dependent Questions | Yes | A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific with student ideas expressed through both |

⁷ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | written and spoken responses. Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. |
| | 3. Coherence of Tasks | Yes | Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. |
| II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Criteria (grades K-5 only)⁸ | 4. Foundational Skills | N/A | |
| | 5. Range and Volume of Texts | | See EdReports for more information. |

⁸ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|---------------------------|---|
| III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality⁹ | 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 7. Assessments | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 8. Scaffolding and Support | | See EdReports for more information. |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier 1, Exemplifies quality | | | |

*As applicable

⁹ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier 1 rating.



Qualified for Abbreviated Review¹

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts³ independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Wit & Wisdom (without Foundational Skills)**

Grade: **5**

Publisher: **Great Minds PBC**

Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier 1, Exemplifies quality**

Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3 Elements of this review:

| STRONG | WEAK |
|---|------|
| 1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable) | |
| 2. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-negotiable) | |
| 3. Coherence of Tasks (Non-negotiable) | |
| 5. Range and Volume of Texts | |
| 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | |
| 7. Assessments | |
| 8. Scaffolding and Support | |
| | |

¹ Abbreviated Reviews are conducted in K-12 ELA and K-12 Math for submissions that **Meet Expectations** for Gateways 1 and Gateway 2 through EdReports. Reviewers considered these reports as they reviewed materials for alignment to Louisiana state standards and quality Non-negotiable indicators. See the full EdReports review at <https://edreports.org/reports/overview/wit-wisdom-2016-3-8>.

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**⁴ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II⁵ and all of the **Non-negotiable** Criteria 1-4 to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet **Non-Negotiable** Criteria 1-3 for the review to continue to Section III.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section III: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

⁴ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “Required” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

⁵ For grades K-5: Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2-3. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--|
| SECTION I. K-12 NON-NEGOTIABLE CRITERIA OF SUPERIOR QUALITY Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2 and 3. For grades K-5, materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section II and all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section III. For grades 6-12, materials must meet all of the Non-Negotiable Criteria 1-3 in order for the review to continue to Section III. | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable</p> <p>1. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>1a) Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A text analysis that includes complexity information is provided. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis, as well as reader and task considerations. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. • In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Anchor texts placed within the four, Grade 5 modules include three literary novels, two informational, and one historical speech. These lengthy, age-appropriate texts promote a singular theme per module. These novels are extensive in the need for historical background knowledge, supplementary materials are utilized throughout to assist in deeper, and more meaningful understanding. The majority of texts fall between 680-1060 Lexile, as identified by quantitative measures. One of the core texts extends past the Grade 5 740-1010 Lexile band and one of the six falls below. The text that exceeds the threshold slightly is introduced in a later module offering student skills an opportunity to grow prior. The text is also guided in a repeated reading setting. Analysis of the text is not conducted until thorough modeling has occurred. Texts extending past the grade level are those that can still be accessible to Grade 5 students with teacher support. Therefore, texts that students are responsible for independently reading are complex in meaning, language and ideas, yet</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>age-appropriate. In Module 1, students read the historical fiction text <i>Thunder Rolling in the Mountains</i>, by Scott O’Dell. Qualitative analysis deems this to be slightly to moderately complex. This rating is due to the chronological structure of the text, as well as the knowledge demands of westward expansion and authentic native expressions which are used figuratively. Students may find this text challenging in a historical sense; however, through supplemental materials such as historic documents, paintings, and photographs students build extensive knowledge prior to a full analysis of the text. This text has a Lexile level of 680 which falls below the 4-5 grade band. This text is utilized as a guided, as well as independent, repeated reading. As this text is reviewed within the first module, it offers a moderately complex starting point to gain key knowledge and literary skills without significant struggle. In Module 2, students read the core text <i>The Phantom Tollbooth</i>, by Norton Juster, an imaginative novel with a Lexile level of 1000. The text requires students to analyze an author’s use of wordplay to create meaning and engage readers. As this is a fantasy, it proves to be challenging in vocabulary which requires explicit instruction. Text structure is straightforward in a chronological sequence and grade level appropriate. This text is deemed very complex through qualitative analysis based on symbolism, puns, and complex, descriptive sensory details. In</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>Module 3, students read the informational text <i>The Boy's War: Confederate and Union Soldiers Talk about the Civil War</i>, by Jim Murphy. This text (1060L), slightly exceeds the Grade 5 quantitative range. Qualitative analysis deems the text as very complex. The sequenced topical structure of the text is clear and straightforward. Narrative, firsthand account writing styles from the author and primary sources assist in adding interest and perspective to historical events of the Civil War. However, complex language, both general academic vocabulary, which can be used across all disciplines and era specific, could pose challenges when determining ideas that are inferential rather than literal. Teacher support is provided throughout with repeated, focused readings to promote success. In Module 4, students read the literary non-fiction text, <i>We Are the Ship: The Story of Negro League Baseball</i>, by Kadir Nelson. This core text is listed as a 900L which is considered well within the appropriate Grade 5 range for quantitative measurements. Qualitative analysis deems this to be moderately complex. The conversational, yet informational narrative writing style draws student interest and attention. It also provides a series of oil paintings that support and enhance meaning. Where students may not need extensive background in baseball vernacular; racial discrimination, prejudice, and World War II topics may prove</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | challenging without context. This text is analyzed through guided instruction countless times to create a thorough understanding for the End-of-Module Tasks. Overall, core and supporting texts are appropriately complex. Modules within the fifth grade unit provide consistent practice with lengthy on-level and above-level texts. Students are challenged in language skills while also being guided through our nation's history. Students participate in an array of activities to acquire key literary and informational experiences that will ultimately translate to benchmark, End-of-Module Task Performance. |
| | <p>Required Indicator 1b) At least 90% of provided texts, including read-alouds in K-2, are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p> | Yes | <p>At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Literary and informational texts following module themes are presented throughout the year. Five of the six core texts offered are critically acclaimed pieces of writing, or have been written by award-winning authors. Texts combine essential opportunities to master literary criteria and incorporate relevant time period content researched heavily by published authors which promotes engaging learning opportunities for students. In Module 1: Cultures in Conflict, Lessons 13-29, students explore how cultural beliefs and values guide people in <i>Thunder Rolling</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>in the Mountains</i>, by Newberry award winning author, Scott O’Dell and Susan Hall. During this reading, students gather, from the poignant perspective of a chief’s daughter, how culture and tradition can be conveyed with great significance and emotion to the reader. In Module 2: Word Play, centers around the modern fantasy novel <i>The Phantom Tollbooth</i>, by Norton Juster, the recipient of the Mathical Book Prize. Over the course of thirty lessons, students build knowledge of how authors use wordplay to engage audiences, create humor and meaning, as well as express themes. Students study the complexity of the English language through a humorous lens in preparation for narrative module writing tasks. In Module 3: A War Between Us, Lessons 6-15, students read the Golden Kite award winner <i>The Boy’s War</i>, by Jim Murphy to investigate a transformative period in American history through the firsthand accounts of boy soldiers within the Civil War. During Lessons 16-37, students explore the novel <i>The River Between Us</i>, by Richard Peck, the recipient of the Scott O’Dell Award and ALSC Notable Children’s Books Award. Students uncover, through the eyes of the Pruitt family, how lives could be irrevocably changed by the Civil War. In Module 4: Breaking Barriers, students focus on a literary nonfiction text to build understanding of the sheer power of sports to bring people together, challenge injustice, and provide hope. This text titled, <i>We Are</i></p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p><i>the Ship: The Story of Negro League Baseball</i>, by Kadir Nelson, is the winner of seven awards including the Odyssey Award and Coretta Scott King Award. Rich oil paintings and narration engage students and assist in learning the perspectives of these worthy sports heroes. Overall, each of the modules offers students the opportunity to build knowledge of content related to the overarching module theme. Students engage with quality, critically acclaimed literary and informational works that promote mastery when paired with standards based learning activities.</p> |
| | <p>Required</p> <p>1c) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex texts. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Each of the four, Grade 5 modules provides various learning opportunities that build through the use of lesson arcs. Within these arcs, learning is centered around Focus Questions which pave a learning path toward answering the overall Essential Question during the End-of-Module Task. Students are supported appropriately depending on the complexity of the texts. For example, in Module 2: Word Play, students venture through four lesson arcs centered around Focus Questions. Each Focus Question building and preparing students for the End-of-Module Task centered around the Essential Question: How and why do writers play with</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>words? In Arc 1, Focus Question 1, Lessons 1-4, the Focus Question, How can wordplay create confusion and humor?” prompts investigation of images and vocabulary to start the unit. Students view the painting <i>The Persistence of Memory</i> by Salvador Dali, watch the video performance “Who’s on First,” and read various riddles to observe (notice/wonder) how artists and writers both play with “reader’s” understanding. Students define wordplay and understand the creation of confusion to promote humor. Students then rewatch the performance to summarize and add to their understanding of confusion from the perspective of the characters. Students write summaries and discuss findings with one another through accountable partner talk, then within whole-group discussion. Students finish their investigation at the end of this arc by applying what they have learned about wordplay through an open, speaking and listening driven, Socratic seminar. Students use their evidence collection from various media to write an explanatory paragraph on how words create both humor and confusion citing evidence from the performance “Who’s on First?” In Arc 2, Focus Question 2, Lessons 5-15, students are guided by the following Focus Question: How can writers use wordplay to develop a story’s setting and characters? Students observe cover art and maps provided in the module anchor text <i>The Phantom Tollbooth</i>, by Norton Juster.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>Students listen to the beginning chapters to make inferences about character traits of the protagonist, as well as to unpack the wordplay within the author’s imaginary land when naming and describing. Students engage in visualization when reading aloud with peers and are able to verbally answer text-dependent questions revolving around setting and character development. Students repeatedly read portions of the text, independently and with partners, to gather essential information of character analysis focusing on the impact of wordplay when introducing new places and individuals. Students participate in “snapshot” writing practice to apply skills in strengthening word choice to indirectly show the audience their visualization rather than tell. Finally, students then utilize their wordplay evidence findings from the text to write a narrative snapshot creating a character of their own creation which the protagonist may meet at a predetermined setting from the novel. Students must introduce this character within the setting using concrete sensory details. In Arc 3, Focus Question 3, Lessons 16-26, students build upon the previous Focus Question by layering introductory narrative features with problems and solutions. Students focus on the question, “How can writers use wordplay to develop a story’s plot?” Within this arc, students follow a similar pattern of observation and organizational analysis. Students are able to sequence events,</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>understand how character actions can propel a plot and determine structural importance within a narrative “hero’s quest” framework. Students steadily practice fluent, expression-filled reading with partners and gather evidence of wordplay within a plot structure. Toward the end of this arc, students utilize their setting, character, and plot wordplay findings to craft an exploded narrative moment from the text, focusing on how wordplay within dialogue can prompt humor, conflict, confusion, and description to move the story forward. Overall, through the use of lesson arcs, Focus Questions build upon each other to establish a foundation of content knowledge. These focused writings prepare students for the End-of-Module Tasks. Reading, writing, speaking and language are present throughout arcs and lessons. These are offered in a manner in which all students can access learning. Lesson arcs follow similar learning structures throughout the modules providing students with confidence in their abilities as texts and concepts become more complex.</p> |
| | <p>Required 1d) Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. These texts are revisited as needed to support knowledge building.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. For example, in Module 1, Cultures in Conflict: students read the core text <i>Thunder Rolling in the Mountains</i>, by Scott O’Dell and Susan Hall. Students are prompted to reread the text to acquire a deeper understanding of main characters.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>For example, in Lesson 18, teacher guidance states, “Remind students that in chapter two they meet Sound of Running Feet’s father, Chief Joseph. Instruct students to turn to pages 6-7 of the novel and independently reread the passage beginning ‘At dawn the wind...’” Students then use their findings to verbally answer the text dependent questions such as, “What does Sound of Running Feet mean on page 7 when she says that Chief Joseph is a ‘chieftain’ but ‘not a warrior’?” Later in Lesson 22, students reread segments of <i>Thunder Rolling in the Mountains</i> in groups with the primary focus of identifying mood, or tone within a scene. Students utilize the chart paper to summarize these chapters using descriptive language and words. Students use a gallery walk model to observe and discuss. In Module 3: A War Between Us, Lesson 22, students read chapter seven aloud with peers. Students are prompted by the teacher to list what they notice, or wonder, while reading. These responses are then discussed by the whole group leading to text dependent questioning. Later in Lesson 22, students reread page 79 of Chapter 7 with peers. As they read, students are challenged to read expressively. After reviewing the text, students must independently address “Mama’s opinion statement” in their response journal and support the opinion with evidence from the text. In Module 4, Breaking Barriers, students read to investigate and research the lives of major</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>league and negro league individuals in history. This is done through the text <i>We Are the Ship: The Story of Negro League Baseball</i> by Kadir Nelson. In Lesson 6, students read Chapter 2 with pairs to annotate using sticky notes key details which describe the type of baseball played by those in the Negro League. Students answer comprehension guiding questions in their response journals and then verbally answer text dependent questions whole group to promote evidence collection. In Lesson 8, students reread <i>We Are the Ship: The Story of Negro League Baseball</i> to determine main ideas of paragraphs and compare chapter structures. Students break into small groups to answer text dependent questions in their response journals. Overall, students revisit texts throughout each module during lesson arcs, as well as during the End-of-Module Task. Students utilize texts for basic comprehension, necessary content knowledge accumulation, purposeful evidence gathering, and expressing understanding through verbal or written expression. Each module has a clear complex text progression using a gradual release model. Students are able to listen to a fluent reader, practice fluent reading with small groups, and reread for evidence collection.</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met) 2. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> | <p>Required 2a) A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Lessons are</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| <p>Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | | | <p>structured in the same manner within each module: Welcome, Launch, Learn, Land, and Wrap. Students are provided text dependent questions (TDQs) steadily over the course of the four modules, especially within the learn segments of each lesson. Students answer TDQs after the focused whole group read aloud and/or small group rereading verbally. Students are also tasked with answering written responses during land segments to express lesson understanding. For example, in Module 1: Cultures in Conflict, Lesson 23, students read <i>Thunder Rolling in the Mountains</i> and respond to questions such as: “Reread the passage on pages 71-72, beginning ‘We had stopped for food..’ and ending ‘...stared straight ahead and said nothing.’ In what ways do the women seem strange to Sound of Running Feet? In what ways do you imagine she seems strange to them?” Later in the module, students read “Lincoln Hall Speech,” an address given by Chief Joseph in 1979. In Lesson 30, students are prompted to answer TDQs within a think-pair-share discussion framework to analyze word choice. These questions include: “In paragraph 4, Chief Joseph says ‘Good words do not last long unless they amount to something.’ What does he mean by this?” and “In paragraph 6, Chief Joseph says, ‘You might as well expect the rivers to run backward as that any man who was born a free man should be contented when penned up and denied liberty.’ What is being compared in this sentence?” In</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Module 2: Word Play, Lesson 9, students read the novel <i>The Phantom Tollbooth</i> to analyze the author's wordplay in narrative elements. Students use handout 9B to respond to the prompt "How do you see the meaning of the word abandon reflected in this description of the town and its people? Underline or highlight details that helped you determine the meaning of the word abandon." Later, students used the knowledge built to complete a quick write in their response journals to answer the following question, "What are some details about Officer Short Shrift's or Mayor McQuitter's looks, words, or actions that helped you infer his or her traits, or personality?" Over the entirety of the module, students answer the overall Essential Question, How and why do writers play with words?" by working toward the End-of-Module Task. In the task, students write a narrative exploded moment mirroring word play craft and structure of the core text. Students must ensure established character traits, setting, and conflict resolution are intact to express understanding and comprehension. In Module 3: A War Between Us, Lesson 25, prior to completing the new read assessment, students read the text <i>The River Between Us</i>, by Richard Peck to analyze how different points of view influence how events are perceived, understood, or described. Students do this by verbally responding to the following TDQ whole</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>group: “Describe the sights and smells that Tilly and Delphine encounter in Cairo and at Camp Defiance.” and “How do these sights and smells influence Tilly’s point of view of Cairo and Camp Defiance? Support your ideas with text evidence.” In Lesson 29, students incorporate all historical texts discussed within the module: A River Between Us, The Boy’s War, and the poem “The Women Who Went to the Field.” Using evidence accumulated thus far and their collaborative conversation frames, students answer questions during their verbal Socratic seminar such as: “Compare and contrast different characters’ experiences of the Civil War based on the texts you’ve read. What is similar and different about the experiences of soldiers and their loved ones at home? Female nurses and females at home? Soldiers and those who cared for the sick and wounded?” In Module 4: Breaking Barriers, Lesson 11, students read <i>We Are the Ship: The Story of Negro League Baseball</i>. In this lesson, during the execution phase, students embark on a gradual release of paragraph writing. Students aim to master, “How do I use directly quoted evidence in a paragraph response?” Individually, students review the Direct Quotations chart which is utilized during the previous lesson when experimenting with using direct quotations. Students practice finding two pieces of evidence from “7th Inning” or “8th Inning” that they could add to their paragraph and use direct</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>quotations. After the practice stage, students use this skill when answering the content-framing question, “Why did major league owners begin to consider integrating baseball?” Overall, text dependent questions are woven amongst lessons daily whether verbally, or within written responses. Students have a variety of verbal response opportunities such as whole group, small group, partner discussion, or Socratic seminar settings. Students consistently build knowledge within their response journals by expressing their understanding. These response journals are reviewed by the teacher and can be utilized by the student for evidence collection during the End-of-Module Task, as well as to demonstrate progression of thinking. Text dependent questions are aligned with module focus throughout.</p> |
| | <p>Required 2b) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. (Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. For example, in Module 2: Word Play, Lesson 13, students determine the meanings of words or phrases as they are used within the text and support them with evidence. These skills are assessed during the land segment of the lesson. Using the text, <i>The Phantom Tollbooth</i>, students answer the question: “Given what you know about the phrase “rhyme or reason” what is the larger significance of Rhyme and</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Reason's banishment in the story? Consider how their banishment impacts the kingdom literally and figuratively. Support your ideas with evidence from the story." (RL5.4). In Module 3: The War Between Us, Lesson 8, students begin their initial read of <i>The Boy's War</i>, by Jim Murphy, to identify the difference between author's points and interesting facts. Students focus on the author's points and supporting details to answer the following questions: "What reasons from the text support the author's point that wearing matching uniforms was important for both Northern and Southern soldiers?" (RI 5.8) and "Identify two pieces of evidence from page 21 that support Jim Murphy's point that 'The southern army seems to have been more disciplined and more relaxed at the same time.'" (RI 5.8). Students then use their accumulated evidence to assist in similarities and differences between Northern and Southern soldiers. In Module 4: Breaking Barriers, Lesson 6, students answer questions based on the text <i>We Are the Ship: A Story of Negro League Baseball</i>, by Kadir Nelson. Using the chapter one text structure evidence handout, students answer text structure questions when rereading and reviewing Chapter 2 such as: "What does Nelson use this text structure to organize the information in this chapter?" (RL 5.5) and "How does Nelson's use of text structure help you better understand the style of play in the Negro League?" (RL 5.5).</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>In Lesson 14, during the vocabulary deep dive, students focus on word relationships within text to answer questions such as, “What words or synonyms did you use to replace fortitude in the quotation?” (L 5.5.c) and “Which of the following words has an opposite meaning to the word antagonism as used in the following sentence?” (L 5.5.c). Overall, the materials provide students with questions that promote deep, meaningful understanding of not only the text, but of the English language skills necessary to demonstrate mastery in culminating tasks. Questions support the module focus while also using standards language.</p> |
| <p>Non-negotiable (only reviewed if Criterion 1 is met)</p> <p>3. COHERENCE OF TASKS: Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required</p> <p>3a) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Module lessons follow five content stages which build knowledge to answer the overall module Focus Question. Materials include the following stages as students engage with module texts: Wonder, Organize, Reveal, and Distill. These five stages offer a coherent sequence of tasks geared toward the module central topic. For example, In Module 1: Cultures in Conflict, Lessons 1-4, students read the two supporting articles “Lewis and Clark and the Indian Country. 1800: A Brilliant Plan for Living” and “Lewis and Clark and the Indian Country: A New Nation Comes to the Indian Country” from</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>the Newberry Library. Students build knowledge through the course of the lesson arc to answer the Focus Question “How did U.S. westward expansion impact Native American cultures in the West?” As these lessons are introductory to fifth grade complex texts, students are guided through each article and work extensively on identifying the main idea and key details of the passages being read as this will be essential in later modules. Students are provided multiple opportunities to review each text and supporting documents such as maps to enhance context. Students are asked to summarize and paraphrase each section of text as they revisit. In Lesson 4, to assess learning students write a summary of one of the supporting texts incorporating three main ideas (one from each subheading) in their own words supported by key details. In Module 3: A War Between Us, Lesson 6, students read <i>The Boy’s War: Confederate and Union Soldiers Talk about the Civil War</i>, by Jim Murphy. Within this lesson, the Wonder phase is initiated. Using skills in observation and inferencing, students view photographs depicting life experiences of boys within the Civil War era. Students begin to determine the impacts of photography during this time period, as well as complete a quick write based on the most influential image, or section within the introduction. In Lesson 7, students continue reading <i>A Boy’s War</i>, with a specific emphasis on Chapter One, to explore the</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>author’s use of primary sources and how they emphasize the main ideas and overall text structure. Students focus on how the author uses reasons and evidence to support details and main ideas. In Lessons 8-13, students enter into a lengthy Reveal phase. Students are offered a period of deep exploration. Students use skills in comparative analysis when understanding northern and southern perspectives, doctor perspectives, and medical knowledge, as well as stances made by the author and evidentiary support. Students practice extensively with author stance and evidence as this promotes strong opinion based writing. Students analyze large portions, or chapters, of the text at this time in Lesson 15. Students use the main idea evidence gathered during previous lessons to answer the opinion Focus Question prompt, “Write an opinion essay in which you explain whether being a soldier in the Civil War affected boys for the better or worse. Use evidence from <i>The Boy’s War</i> to develop two reasons. Elaborate on the evidence to support.” In Module 4: Breaking Barriers, Lessons 5-16, students focus on the Essential Question, How can sports influence individuals and societies? The core text <i>We Are the Ship: The Story of Negro League Baseball</i>, by Kadir Nelson is utilized to build knowledge of not only an inspiring individual, Jackie Robinson, but the history of those how the negro league prospered and established change. Students are guided</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>through the five content stages to observe and analyze the impact of text structure, how illustrations support overall reader understanding of the main idea, as well as supporting a claim or point. Each of these content stages leads to the culmination of learning in Lesson 16. After extensively reading the core text, students develop thesis statements and supporting reasoning when answering the prompt, “Plan a speech to give to students at your school... explaining why the negro leagues and its players should be honored and remembered on April fifteenth. Use evidence to develop three points to support your thesis.” These explanatory and reasoning learning opportunities across the module support student success in the End-of-Module Task Essential Question task by building understanding of effective evidence as well as history and the impact that sports can have on societal norms. The evidence collected and previous writings can be utilized as a stepping stone to mastery. Overall, students consistently engage in content stages that are coherently sequenced to promote thought and rigor, which build the skills necessary to express thoughtful text analysis through spoken and written responses.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3b) Questions and tasks are designed so that students build, apply, and integrate knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts.</p> | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. For example, in Module 1:</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Cultures in Conflict, students engage in a variety of learning activities which lead to answering the overarching Essential Question, How do cultural beliefs and values guide people? In Lesson 26, students complete their investigation of the core text <i>Thunder Rolling in the Mountains</i> by reading the afterword to discover what happened to the main and supporting characters years following the surrender at Bear Paw. Students engage in small-group discussion to evaluate similarities and differences in beliefs and values. Students review and use criteria for the module speaking goal, Speak Collaboratively. When in discussion, students answer questions such as: “What important beliefs and values do Chief Joseph and his daughter Sound of Running Feet share?” “How do their beliefs differ?” and “By the end of the novel, how and why have Sound of Running Feet’s beliefs changed?” Students take notes during this discussion and self-assess their participation and success in the module goal using a checklist. In Lesson 27, students build upon their small-group discussion by utilizing notes, as well as their evidence organizer from Lesson 18, to begin their written response to Focus Question task five which states, “Write an essay to compare and contrast Chief Joseph and Sound of Running Feet’s most important beliefs and values.” Students are guided through the process of creating a thesis whole group then begin to use Handout 27A: Essay Planner to draft their response.</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | <p>Once drafted, students have the opportunity to fluently rehearse their draft with partners to receive feedback and address grammar concerns using a priority checklist. Module 3: The War Between Us, addresses the Essential Question, How did the Civil War impact people? In Lesson 24, students read chapter nine of <i>A River Between Us</i> and participate in a reader's theater simulation using an emotional scene between Tilly and her mother. Discussion is stimulated amongst pairs concerning the impact of the war on female members of a family. Students answer text dependent questions both verbally and written, such as: "How has Noah's leaving impacted mama? What details in the scene show Tilly - and readers - a change in mama? Write down one or two details that show this change." and "How does mama's behavior in this scene impact Tilly? How do you know?" Students then learn to add evidence of character impact to a practice perspective writing by applying what they have learned. In Lesson 27, students use all the acquired evidence from Handout 26A: Character Change Chart and lesson skill progression to complete the following Focus Question three task: "Write a journal entry from Tilly's first person point of view that states this opinion: the war and the experiences in Cairo and Camp Defiance have changed both her and Delphine by making them both grow up and become young women." This task aligns with the overall module Essential Question and</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|---|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>accumulated evidence from both <i>A Boy's War</i> and <i>A River Between Us</i> is utilized when completing the Socratic Seminar in Lesson 29 which requires students to discuss experiences and perspectives of both males and females. Overall, module lesson progression allows for students to build, apply, and eventually integrate knowledge to demonstrate reading, writing, speaking, listening and language skills. Gradual release of skills is offered during individual lessons, as well as across lesson arcs to ensure success when interacting with complex texts.</p> |
| | <p>Required 3c) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically related words, word families, etc.) rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | <p>Yes</p> | <p>Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. Throughout each module, students engage in vocabulary and language use Deep Dives. These craft lessons cycle through stages that mirror a gradual release. Stages include: Examine, Experiment, and Execute. These opportunities conclude each lesson within the module and meet a range of language standards. For example, in Module 1: Cultures in Conflict, Lesson 3, students begin to identify, categorize, and describe the function of prepositional</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>phrases. Students receive a short, stand-alone guided lesson on identifying prepositions and prepositional phrases. Once completed with the review, students work with the lesson supporting text “Lewis and Clark and the Indian Country: A New Nation Comes to the Indian Country” to practice identifying prepositional phrases within excerpts, as well as categorizing these phrases to determine what information the detail provides. The importance of prepositional phrases is addressed during the lesson closing when answering the question, “How do prepositional phrases impact, or change, sentences?” In Lesson 6, students begin to experiment with prepositional phrases. The teacher models how to insert phrases to incorporate detail using example sentences from the text. To practice, students then revise their topic statement from the lesson by determining what details they wish to add to ultimately enhance the sentence. Finally, in Lesson 7, students execute their understanding of prepositional phrases by expanding and combining sentences both with text materials and student created writing. In Module 3, students work toward understanding and practicing skills based on styles and conventions. In Lesson 17, students examine the use of dialect within a text. Students begin by working with partners to determine pronunciation of common words. This prompts a discussion to answer the question, “Why do authors</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>use dialects in their writing?” Students examine sentences from an excerpt of the core text <i>A River Between Us</i> to rewrite how someone may say these sentences differently. In Lesson 18, students continue working with dialects from the text <i>The River Between Us</i> to compare and contrast the dialects between the two characters Delphine and Tilly. Students identify evidence of dialects within a portion of text with partners to answer the ultimate question, “How do Tilly and Delphine’s dialects differ?” Finally, in Lesson 19, students demonstrate their understanding of dialects by rewriting spoken passages in the Pruitt families’ dialect to Delphine’s dialect. In Module 4: Breaking Barriers, Lesson 18, students are introduced to correlative conjunctions. Students examine an excerpt from the supporting text “Afghan Sprinter Tahmina Kohistani Shows What’s Possible for Muslim Women” to identify common conjunctions. Students then receive a short, stand-alone lesson identifying different correlative conjunctions. The teacher prompts students to work in pairs to practice utilizing these conjunctions within sentence frames pertaining to the reading, such as, “ _____ criticism _____ fear could stop Tahmina from training as a sprinter.” After practicing verbally with pairs, students answer the following prompt in whole group using correlative conjunctions: “How are Tahmina’s experiences and the experiences</p> |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | <p>of the Negro League baseball players similar and different?” In Lesson 19, students begin to experiment with the structure of sentences utilizing correlative conjunctions, observing that the example sentences combine two independent clauses of similar length. Students work together in pairs to write a sentence incorporating key information gathered during the lesson from the supporting text. Finally, in Lesson 21, students use the supporting text, “Helping Refugee Kids Find Their Footing in the U.S.” and execute correlative conjunctions within their own writing. The teacher directs students to reread and revise their reflections about the refugees that they wrote in the core lesson. Students verbally share their revisions and are provided feedback from peers and the teacher. Throughout the materials, students consistently examine, experiment, and execute language skills. Students build knowledge on the use of that language within a genre for mastery in later tasks. Language skills are assessed in verbal and written prompts throughout the modules whether in individual lessons or Focus Questions.</p> |
| Section II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Indicators (Grades K-5 only) | | | |
| <p>Non-negotiable* 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness,</p> | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4a) Materials provide and follow a logical sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards (based on the Vertical Progression of Foundational Skills) while providing abundant opportunities for every</p> | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only Indicator 4b) Materials provide grade-appropriate instruction and practice for the concepts of print (e.g., following words left to right, top to bottom, page by page; words are followed by spaces; and features of a sentence).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-1 only 4c) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonological awareness instruction (e.g., recognizing rhyming words; clapping syllables; blending onset-rime; and blending, segmenting, deleting, and substituting phonemes).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4d) Materials provide systematic and explicit phonics instruction. Instruction progresses from simple to more complex sound–spelling patterns and word analysis skills that includes repeated modeling and opportunities for students to hear, say, write, and read sound and spelling patterns (e.g. sounds, words, sentences, reading within text).</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only Indicator 4e) Materials provide multiple opportunities and practice for students to master grade appropriate high-frequency words using multisensory techniques.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4f) Resources and/or texts provide ample practice of foundational reading skills using texts (e.g. decodable readers) and allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of reading foundational skills, including phonics patterns and word analysis skills in decoding words.</p> | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4g) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and/or informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p> <p>Materials provide opportunities for students to self-monitor to confirm or self-correct word errors directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p> <p>This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p> | N/A | |
| | <p>Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only</p> <p>4h) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. (<i>Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.</i>) • In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic | N/A | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns. | | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4i) Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring includes attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value. | N/A | |
| | Required *Indicator for grades K-5 only 4j) Foundational Skills materials are abundant and easily implemented so that teachers can spend time, attention and practice with students who need foundational skills supports. | N/A | |
| Section III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality | | | |
| <p>5. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 5a) Materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The majority of informational texts have an informational text structure. • In grades 3-12, narrative structure (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays) of informational text are also included. | | See EdReports for more information. |
| <p>Required 5b) Materials include print and/or non-print texts in a variety of formats (e.g. a range of film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories, poetry, and novels).</p> | | | |
| <p>5c) Additional materials provide direction and practice for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina,</p> | | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and develop knowledge of classroom concepts or topics. | | |
| <p>6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE: The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 6a) Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.⁶</p> <p>Required *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 6b) The majority of oral and written tasks require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p> <p>Required 6c) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s). • In grades 3-12, tasks may include blended modes (e.g., analytical writing). | | |

⁶ Technology and digital media may be used, when appropriate, to support the standards addressed in this indicator.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | <p>Required 6d) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own sentence construction as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage. | | |
| <p>7. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>Required 7a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7b) Materials assess student understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the unit texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students demonstrate the knowledge and skill built over the course of the unit.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 7d) Measurement of progress via assessments include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p> | | |
| <p>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below</p> | <p>Required 8a) As needed, pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| <p>grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>students with understanding the text itself (i.e. providing background knowledge, supporting vocabulary acquisition). Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of skills or strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts do not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8c) Materials include guidance and support that regularly directs teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading and discussion about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8d) Materials provide additional supports for expressing understanding through formal discussion and writing development (i.e. sentence frames, paragraph frames, modeled writing, student exemplars).</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8e) Materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. Teacher editions are concise and easy to manage with clear connections between teacher resources. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus.</p> | | |
| | <p>Required 8f) Support for English Learners and diverse learners is provided. Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level. The language in which questions and problems are posed is not an obstacle to understanding the content, and if it is, additional supports are included (e.g., alternative teacher approaches, pacing and instructional delivery</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| | options, strategies or suggestions for supporting access to text and/or content, suggestions for modifications, suggestions for vocabulary acquisition, etc.). | | |
| | 8g) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. Materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take. | | |

FINAL EVALUATION

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-III to make a final decision for the material under review.

| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
|--|---------------------|------------|--|
| I. K-12 Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality⁷ | 1. Quality of Texts | Yes | Materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. At least 90% of texts are of publishable quality and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials do provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about themes with connected topics and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language. Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level |

⁷ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|----------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| | | | complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study. |
| | 2. Text-Dependent Questions | Yes | A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific with student ideas expressed through both written and spoken responses. Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. |
| | 3. Coherence of Tasks | Yes | Coherence sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations, making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2. Questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words rather than isolated vocabulary practice, and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts. |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (YES/NO) | JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|---|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| II. K-5 Non-negotiable Foundational Skills Criteria (grades K-5 only)⁸ | 4. Foundational Skills | N/A | |
| III. Additional Criteria of Superior Quality⁹ | 5. Range and Volume of Texts | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 7. Assessments | | See EdReports for more information. |
| | 8. Scaffolding and Support | | See EdReports for more information. |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier 1, Exemplifies quality | | | |

*As applicable

⁸ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier 1 or Tier 2 rating.

⁹ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier 1 rating.

Instructional materials are one of the most important tools educators use in the classroom to enhance student learning. It is critical that they fully align to state standards—what students are expected to learn and be able to do at the end of each grade level or course—and are high quality if they are to provide meaningful instructional support.

The Louisiana Department of Education is committed to ensuring that every student has access to high-quality instructional materials. In Louisiana all districts are able to purchase instructional materials that are best for their local communities since those closest to students are best positioned to decide which instructional materials are appropriate for their district and classrooms. To support local school districts in making their own local, high-quality decisions, the Louisiana Department of Education leads online reviews of instructional materials.

Instructional materials are reviewed by a committee of Louisiana educators. Teacher Leader Advisors (TLAs) are a group of exceptional educators from across Louisiana who play an influential role in raising expectations for students and supporting the success of teachers. Teacher Leader Advisors use their robust knowledge of teaching and learning to review instructional materials.

The [2022-2023 Teacher Leader Advisors](#) are selected from across the state and represent the following parishes and school systems: A.E. Phillips, Ascension, Belle Chasse Academy, Bienville, Caddo, Calcasieu, Catholic Diocese of Baton Rouge -REACH Department, East Baton Rouge, Hynes Charter School Corporation, Iberia, Iberville, Jefferson, KIPP New Orleans, Lafayette, Lafourche, Lincoln, Louisiana Virtual Charter Academy, LSU Laboratory School, Orleans, Monroe City Schools, Morehouse, Orleans, Ouachita, Plaquemines, Rapides, Richland, St. Landry, St. Martin, St. Mary, St. Tammany, Tangipahoa, University View Academy, Vermillion, Webster, West Feliciana, and Zachary Community Schools. This review represents the work of current classroom teachers with experience in ECE and grades K-5.

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The publisher had no response.

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.